Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2008

Caleb G. Putnam

146 Timmer Dr. NE Sparta, MI 49345

This is the 19th report of the Michigan Bird Records Committee, covering the Committee's actions in 2008. The members of the Committee in 2008 were Rick Brigham (Allegan Co.), Adam M. Byrne (Clinton Co.), Lathe Claflin (Jackson Co.), Joe Kaplan (Houghton Co.), Brad Murphy (Oakland Co.), Caleb G. Putnam (Kent Co.), and Scott Terry (Oakland Co.), with alternate members Jim Dawe (Oscoda Co.) and Louis Dombroski (Bay Co.). Putnam was Chairman and Byrne was Secretary. Per bylaw E.5 the votes of past committee members Jeff Buecking, Philip C. Chu, and Jack Reinoehl were solicited and used during 2008.

During 2008, the committee made 255 decisions on 198 records, with 124 (48.6%) of the decisions being to accept; 109 (55.1%) of the records resulted in the acceptance of at least one individual. The discrepancy between the number of decisions and the number of records was because 21 records involved multiple individual birds, each individual requiring a separate decision. Second, 10 records were re-reviewed as a different species group following initial rejection; for example, a Western Grebe (Aechmophorus occidentalis) that was initially rejected was then re-reviewed as an Aechmophorus grebe.

During 2008 the committee received two requests for reconsideration: a Glossy Ibis (rejected unanimously), and a Red Phalarope (approved by majority vote).

In 2006 the MBRC noticed a discrepancy in past and current voting standards. Namely, approximately 30-40 records in the MBRC database had originally been accepted based on 5-2, 5-1-1, or 5-0-2 tallies (Putnam 2007, 2008). Since these tallies would now connote resubmission rather than acceptance, the committee decided to bring all of the old records up to the current standard by re-evaluating them. This process was continued in 2008, with one additional record receiving reconsideration.

Two species, Neotropic Cormorant (*Phalacrocorax brasilianus*) and Violetgreen Swallow (*Tachycineta thalassina*) were added to the Michigan state checklist during 2008. This brings the total state list to 434 species. One species, Swallow-tailed Kite (*Elanoides forficatus*), was upgraded from accidental to casual status, while Curlew Sandpiper (*Calidris ferruginea*) was downgraded from casual to accidental. A final species, Lark Sparrow (*Chondestes grammacus*) was upgraded from casual to regular, but will remain on the review list through at least 2011, per bylaw D.1.

Several nomenclatural and taxonomic changes were made during 2008 to bring the state checklist into concordance with the 49th supplement to the American Ornithologists' Union Checklist of North American Birds (Banks et al. 2008). Namely, Bonaparte's Gull (Larus philadelphia) and Blackheaded Gull (L. ridibundus) were moved to the genus Chroicocephalus, Little Gull (L. minutus) was moved to the genus Hydrocoloeus, and Laughing Gull (L. atricilla) and Franklin's Gull (L. pipixcan) were moved to the genus Leucophaeus. The Laridae was also reordered (see the state checklist at the MBRC website [URL below] or Banks et al. [2008] for details). Finally, the common name Green Violet-ear (Colibri thalassinus) was changed to Green Violetear.

A current version of the checklist and review list may be downloaded at the committee's website: http://www.michiganaudubon.org/research/records_committee.html

Bylaws amendments

At the spring meeting the committee voted to change Bylaw C.3. to:

The University of Michigan Museum of Zoology shall be the prime repository of specimens, recordings, photographs, and written documentation of Michigan birds. The Secretary shall be responsible for maintaining a second repository for storing duplicate materials.

This change eliminated the requirement of the secretary to store duplicate materials at the Kalamazoo Nature Center.

Also at the spring meeting, the committee voted to change Bylaw E.2. to:

Resubmissions will be discussed at a meeting before being circulated for the second vote.

- No person, whether a member of the committee or not, will be present when his or her record is discussed for resubmission.
- b. For a record that is to be resubmitted, members who are physically present for the resubmission discussion will be given voting priority over members who are absent.
 - (i) If more than seven members are present, then for those present the standard voting hierarchy will be followed.
 - (ii) If fewer than seven are present, so that votes from one or more absentees are needed, then regarding the absentees votes from regular members will be used on a first-come basis, and regular members will be given priority over alternates (assuming votes were cast by the deadline stipulated in E.4).

This change allots voting preference on resubmitted records to those committee members that were present at the MBRC meeting in which the resubmission discussion occurred.

At the fall meeting, the committee voted to change Bylaw E.5. to:

Members will abstain from voting on records for which they have submitted documentation; members will not abstain on any other votes. When it is not possible to get seven votes for a record, votes will be solicited from past committee members, starting with the most recently replaced member and going back in succession until there are enough eligible and willing voters; in cases where more than one committee member rotated off the committee at the same time, those committee members will be contacted simultaneously and the first to respond positively will be used. Past committee members will be given seven days to respond to the solicitation before the next past committee member is contacted.

This change clarified the process of contacting and selecting ex-MBRC members for voting assistance on records for which outside votes were required due to an excessive number of abstentions.

Policy Changes

At the spring 2008 meeting the committee approved a policy redefining meeting attendance as such:

A committee meeting is defined as members of Michigan Bird Records Committee who are physically present at a meeting. Members who are not physically present are excluded from the meeting.

This policy was necessary to properly enforce bylaw E.2, which specifies vote tallying procedures for meeting attendees and absentees. It encourages members to attend meetings in person, and disallows participation via phone conferencing.

Records Accepted

Black-bellied Whistling-Duck (Dendrocygna autumnalis)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: David J. Peters, Donald

Poppe

Photographs: David J. Peters

One individual was observed at Shiawassee National Wildlife Refuge, Saginaw Co., on 29 September-1 October 2008.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 6-1, in the second round Photographs: Chris Barrigar

One individual, a white morph adult, was observed at the Royalton Twp., Berrien Co., on 14 March 2007.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 6-1, for one individual Descriptions: Sean Fitzgerald, Caleb G. Putnam

Photographs: Caleb G. Putnam,

Dave Slager

One individual, a white morph adult, was observed at the Muskegon Wastewater Management System, Muskegon Co., on 25-28 October 2007. This individual was accompanied by two pale morph juvenile geese which were thought by the observers to be either pure Ross's Geese or Ross's Goose X Snow Goose (C. caerulescens) hybrids, both of which were rejected as Ross's Geese (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Karl Overman Photographs: Karl Overman

One individual, a white morph adult, was observed at Belle Isle, Wayne Co., on 26 November 2007.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Allen Chartier, Scott

Jennex

One individual, a white morph adult, was observed at Willow Metropark, Wayne Co., on 30 November-4 December 2007.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 7-0, in the second round Photographs: Ed Kaminski

One individual, a white morph adult, was observed at Boardman Lake, Grand Traverse Co., on 13-31 March 2008.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 6-1

Description: Karl Overman Photographs: Scott Jennex, Karl Overman

One individual, a white morph adult, was observed near Caseville, Huron Co., on 5 April 2008.

Brant (Branta bernicla)

Vote: 7-0, for seven individuals Description: Robert J. Holdreith Photographs: Robert J. Holdreith

Seven individuals, including 3 adults and 4 juveniles, were observed at Port Huron, St. Clair Co., on 12 October 2007.

Brant (Branta bernicla)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Chip Francke

One juvenile was observed at Grand Haven, Ottawa Co., on 1 November 2008.

Trumpeter Swan (Cygnus buccinator)

Vote: 6-1

Descriptions: Kelly J. Leinaar Photographs: Kelly J. Leinaar

One adult was observed on Tee Lake, near Germfask, Schoolcraft Co., on 28 May-19 October 1990. This individual wore a yellow neck band with the combination "36-FA", which proved to be an adult female from the LaCreek restoration effort in Martin, South Dakota. The individual had been banded there on 18 July 1988 and last seen in December of 1989. At issue was whether this individual was from a self-sustaining population (versus a reintroduced one), given that its identification was confirmed by its band. The LaCreek population had been introduced in the early 1960s and was selfsustaining as of the late 1980s, eliminating this concern for most of the committee. This same individual was seen at the same location on 20 April-12 October 1991.

Cinnamon Teal (Anas cyanoptera)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Adam M. Byrne, Brad

Murphy

Photographs: Bruce Bowman

One drake was observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 9 June 2007.

Tufted Duck (Aythya fuligula)

Vote: 6-1

Photographs: Jeff Schultz

One drake was observed at Lake Erie Metropark, Wayne Co., on 16 April 2006.

King Eider (Somateria spectabilis)

Vote: 7-0

Photograph: Nathan Crawford
One first year male was
observed at Belle Isle, Wayne Co.,
on 21-22 November 2008.

Common Eider (Somateria mollissima)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Scott Hickman Photographs: Skye Haas, Scott Hickman

One individual, a hen, was observed at Grand Marais, Alger Co., on 29 June-1 July 2007.

Pacific Loon (Gavia pacifica)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Skye Haas

Photographs: Ryne Rutherford

One individual in first alternate plumage was observed at Keweenaw Bay, Baraga, Baraga Co., on 4 June 2007.

Pacific Loon (Gavia pacifica)

Vote: 6-1

Description: Cory Gregory

One individual in adult alternate plumage was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 25 September 2007.

Pacific Loon (Gavia pacifica)

Vote: 5-2, in the second round Description: Greg Norwood

One individual in adult alternate plumage was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 28 September 2007.

Pacific Loon (Gavia pacifica)

Vote: 5-2, in the second round Description: Cory Gregory

One individual in adult alternate plumage was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 9 October 2007. The committee had some concern regarding several near verbatim paragraphs from the writeup and another written by Gregory. However, these concerns were allayed by the fact that it seemed reasonable for him to have seen two very similar individuals as the official waterbird counter at Whitefish Point Bird Observatory.

Pacific Loon (Gavia pacifica)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Joe Agius, Sean Bachman, Adam M. Byrne, Allen T. Chartier, Philip C. Chu, Lathe Claflin, James Dawe, Margaret S. Jewett Photographs: Joe Agius, Bruce Bowman, Adam M. Byrne, Allen T. Chartier, Darlene Freidman

One individual in juvenile plumage was observed at Portage Lake, Washtenaw Co., on 25 December 2007-2 January 2008.

Pacific Loon (Gavia pacifica)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Skye Haas

One individual in basic aspect, either in its 1st or 2nd summer, was observed at Marquette, Marquette Co., on 26 May-2 June 2008.

observed at Lake Erie Metropark, Wayne Co., on 22 December 2001. Initially rejected as Northern Gannet (Byrne 2004), this record was here given reconsideration as Sulid sp., consistent with current MBRC practice.

One individual was

Aechmophorus grebe (Aechmophorus Neotropic Cormorant occidentalis/clarkii)

Vote: 6-1

Description: James C. Dawe One individual was observed at Oscoda, losco Co., on 21 October 2007.

Aechmophorus grebe (Aechmophorus occidentalis/clarkii)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Joseph Youngman Photographs: Joseph Youngman

One individual was observed at Keweenaw Bay, about 4 miles north of L'Anse, Baraga Co., on 10 December 2007.

Northern Gannet (Morus bassanus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Calvin Brennan Photographs: Darlene Friedman, Joshua Haas

One juvenile was observed at Lake Erie Metropark, Wayne Co., on 24 November-1 December 2007.

Sulid species (Morus/Sula sp.)

Vote: 6-1

Description: Mike Mencotti

(Phalacrocorax brasilianus)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Philip C. Chu, Caleb G. Putnam

Photographs: Rick Brigham, Adam M. Byrne, Caleb G. Putnam

One individual, a first state record, was observed at Grand Haven, Ottawa Co., on 5-20 May 2008.

Magnificent Frigatebird (Fregata magnificens)

Vote: 6-1

Description: Matthew Hysell One adult male was observed at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 26 September 2008.

Frigatebird species (Fregata sp.)

Vote: 5-2, in the second round **Description: Angela Sabatos**

One individual, either a female or subadult male, was observed at Au Train Lake, Alger Co., on 6 September 2007. This report was initially rejected as Magnificent Frigatebird (see below under "Records Not Accepted"), but was here given reconsideration under a broader grouping.
Although there was some concern over whether a very high Great Blue Heron (Ardea herodias) could be ruled out (the legs appearing to be a long, forked tail) and regarding the bird's exact size and the extent of its "white bib," the majority of the committee was satisfied with the documentation.

Frigatebird species (Fregata sp.)

Vote: 6-1

Descriptions: Larry Burke, Steve

Burke

One individual, an apparent adult male, was observed at Lake Leelanau, Leelanau Co., on 20 September 2008.

Glossy Ibis (Plegadis falcinellus)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Patrick Foote

One adult was observed at Douglas, Allegan Co., on 6 May 2008, with three White-faced lbises (see below under "Records Accepted").

White-faced Ibis (Plegadis chihi)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Patrick Foote

Three adults were observed at Douglas, Allegan Co., on 6 May 2008, with a single Glossy Ibis (see above under "Records Accepted").

Plegadis ibis (Plegadis falcinellus/chihi)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Philip C. Chu

One individual was observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 29 June-28 July 1991. This bird was part of a group of four individuals initially accepted as Glossy Ibises (Chu 1992). However, only three of the four individuals remained as Glossy Ibises following reconsideration of the record in 2007 (Putnam 2008). The fourth individual, rejected as Glossy Ibis, is here reconsidered as a *Plegadis* ibis.

Plegadis ibis (Plegadis falcinellus/chihi)

Vote: 6-1, in the second round Description: Steven Gasser

One individual was observed at Nayanquing Point State Wildlife Area, Bay Co., on 28 May 2008. This report was initially rejected as Glossy Ibis (see below under "Records Not Accepted"), but was here reconsidered as a broader species grouping, per current MBRC practice.

Plegadis ibis (Plegadis falcinellus/chihi)

Vote: 7-0, for one individual Description: Sena Mulder Photographs: Sena Mulder

Two individuals were reported in Saugatuck Twp.,
Allegan Co., on 15 November 2008. The first individual,
documented by photographs, was clearly an ibis. However, the second

individual was not described, leading to its rejection (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

Black Vulture (Coragyps atratus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Matt Hysell

Photographs: Tim Baerwald, Matt

Hysell, Andre Moncrieff

One individual was observed at Berrien Springs, Berrien Mississippi Kite (Ictinia Co., on 4-6 September 2007.

Black Vulture (Coragyps atratus)

Vote: 6-1

Photographs: Jeff Pavlik

One individual was observed near Bell, Presque Isle Co., on 14 September 2007.

Black Vulture (Coragyps atratus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Lathe Claffin Photograph: Paul Cypher

One individual was observed at Lake Erie Metropark, Wayne Co., on 14 October 2008.

Black Vulture (Coragyps atratus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Joe Kaplan, Mary Hindelang & Mark Silver

Photographs: George Desort

One individual was observed near Chassell, Houghton Co., on 17 October-17 November 2008.

Swallow-tailed Kite (Elanoides forficatus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Nancy Warren Photographs: Nancy Warren

One individual was observed about 3 miles southwest of Matchwood, Ontonagon Co., on

18 August 2008.

mississipiensis)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Jeff Schultz One individual was observed at Milan, Washtenaw Co., on 21 May 1999.

Prairie Falcon (Falco mexicanus)

Vote: 7-0, in the second round Description: Monica Essenmacher One individual was observed at Port Crescent State Park, Huron Co., on 3 April 2008.

Black Rail (Laterallus jamaicensis)

Vote: 7-0, for one individual Descriptions: Chris Barrigar, Rick Brigham, Adam M. Byrne, Philip C. Chu, Jonathan T. Wuepper Audio recordings: Andre Moncrieff, Caleb G. Putnam

Two individuals were reported in Royalton Twp., Berrien Co., on 13-24 May 2007. This record consisted of several heardonly observations, some of which were thought to include a second individual heard calling from a distance nearly simultaneously

to the first individual. The first individual was unanimously accepted, but the second individual was rejected (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

King Rail (Rallus elegans)

Vote: 7-0, in the second round Description: Michael A. Sanders

Two individuals were reported at Harsen's Island, St. Clair Co., on 8 May 2007. The first individual, which was photographed, was accepted in 2007 (Putnam 2008). However, the second individual was heardonly, and there was some question as to whether one individual could have produced the appearance of two calling birds. Some members had the additional concern that the fleeting description of the second individual's voice was insufficient to rule out Virainia Rail's (Rallus limicola) very similar "kik-kikkrr" call. After discussion, all felt that since the observer correctly identified the first individual by voice, it was very unlikely he misidentified the second individual which was vocalizing at the same time.

King Rail (Rallus elegans)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Adam M. Byrne
One was observed at
Pointe Mouillee State Game Area,
Monroe Co., on 17 June 2007.

King Rail (Rallus elegans)

Vote: 7-0, for one of two individuals Description: Steven Gasser Photographs: Doug Jackson

Two were reported at Bay-Arenac Rd., Bay & Arenac Cos., on 27 June 2008. The photographs clearly showed one King Rail, but the second individual was not supported by either written or photographic evidence (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

Black-necked Stilt (Himantopus mexicanus)

Vote: 7-0, for six individuals Descriptions: Adam M. Byrne, Philip C. Chu, Jerome S. Jourdan, Matt Yawney

Photographs: Adam M. Byrne, Jerome S. Jourdan, Brad Murphy, Caleb G. Putnam

Six individuals, two adults and their four offspring, were observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 13 June-30 August 2008. By the end of this period only the adult male and three of the young were to be found, the fate of the adult female and 4th juvenile unknown.

Western Sandpiper (Calidris mauri)

Vote: 6-1

Description: Bruce Bowman Photographs: Bruce Bowman

One juvenile was observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 31 August 2008.

Western Sandpiper (Calidris mauri)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Adam M. Byrne Photographs: Adam M. Byrne, Brad

Murphy, Caleb G. Putnam

One juvenile was observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 6-15 September 2008. This record was deemed to involve a separate individual from that in the previous record as photos clearly showed different plumage traits.

Ruff (Philomachus pugnax)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Allen T. Chartier Photographs: Robert Epstein, Darlene Friedman, Lyle Hamilton

One individual, age and sex undetermined, was observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 19-23 August 2008. Vote: 7-0

Red Phalarope (Phalaropus fulicarius)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Scott Hickman Photographs: Byron Butler, Lyle

Hamilton, Scott Hickman

One individual, a juvenile beginning its transition into formative plumage, was observed at Munising, Alger Co., on 13 October 2007.

Heermann's Gull (Larus heermanni)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Joseph Youngman

One juvenile was observed at Chassell, Houghton Co., on 18 July 2008.

Glaucous-winged Gull (Larus glaucescens)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Matt Hysell, Caleb G.

Putnam

Photographs: Tim Baerwald, Adam M. Byrne, Matt Hysell, Caleb G. Putnam

Video: Caleb G. Putnam

One individual, either an adult or a fourth calendar year individual, wearing alternate plumage, was observed at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 2 May 2008.

Pomarine Jaeger (Stercorarius pomarinus)

Description: Brian Allen

One individual, a light morph adult, was observed at Manistee, Manistee Co., on 3 September 2007.

White-winged Dove (Zenaida asiatica)

Vote: 6-1

Description: Alan Ryff

One individual was observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 13 August 2007.

White-winged Dove (Zenaida asiatica)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Barb and Jeff

Brockway

One individual was observed at Milakokia Lake, Mackinac Co., on 7 September 2008.

White-winged Dove (Zenaida asiatica)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Mike Champagne
One individual was
observed at Seven Ponds Nature
Center, Lapeer Co., on 29 October
2008.

Barn Owl (Tyto alba)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Paul Revard
One individual was

observed at Tawas Point State Park, losco Co., on 16 September 2007.

Chuck-will's-widow (Caprimulgus carolinensis)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Marvin E. Budd, Jonathan T. Wuepper

Audio Recordings: Marvin E. Budd

One individual was observed in Berrien Twp., Berrien Co., on 8 May-5 July 2008. This was the 4th consecutive summer in which a Chuck-will's-widow was observed at this location.

Green Violetear (Colibri thalassinus)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Scott Hickman, Kirk

Zufelt

Photographs: Robert Epstein, Scott Hickman, Chris Neri, Kirk Zufelt

One individual was observed at Laughing Whitefish Point, Alger Co., on 5-6 July 2008.

Green Violetear (Colibri thalassinus)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Sheryl Nelson
One individual was
observed at Grand Rapids, Kent
Co., on 18-28 October 2008.

Rufous Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Allen T. Chartier Photographs: Allen T. Chartier

One individual, an adult female, was observed (including capture) at DeWitt, Clinton Co., on 17 October-22 November 2007.

Rufous Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Allen T. Chartier Photographs: Allen T. Chartier

One individual, a first year female, was observed (including capture) near Bangor, Van Buren Co., on "mid-October"-5 December 2007.

Rufous Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Allen T. Chartier Photographs: Allen T. Chartier

One individual, a first year male, was observed (including capture) at Kalamazoo, Kalamazoo Co., on 28 October-22 December 2007.

Rufous Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Allen T. Chartier Photographs: Tim Baerwald, Allen T. Chartier

One individual, a first year female, was observed (including capture) in Benton Twp., Berrien Co., on 5-11 November 2007.

Rufous Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Allen T. Chartier, Philip C. Chu, Nancy Gillis, Caleb G.

Putnam

Photographs: Allen T. Chartier, Robert Epstein, Nancy Gillis, Caleb G. Putnam

One individual, an adult male, was observed at Holland, Ottawa Co., on 7 November-4 December 2008.

Rufous/Allen's Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus/sasin)

Vote: 6-1

Description: Carol Burchett Photograph: Carol Burchett

One was observed "near Millington," Tuscola Co., on 29-30 September 2007. First rejected as Rufous Hummingbird (see below under "Records Not Accepted"), this record was here given reconsideration under a broader species grouping.

American Three-toed Woodpecker (Picoides dorsalis)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Ruth A. Rudesill

One was observed "near Bear Lake," Baraga Co., on 14 July 2004.

American Three-toed Woodpecker (Picoides dorsalis)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Joe Kaplan

One was observed at Copper Harbor, Keweenaw Co., on 16 November 2007.

American Three-toed Woodpecker (Picoides dorsalis)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Alexander Egan

One was observed at Isle Royale National Park, Keweenaw Co., on 24 January 2008.

American Three-toed Woodpecker (Picoides dorsalis)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Rick Baetsen

One was observed at Northwestern Rd., Marquette Co., on 5 October 2008.

Say's Phoebe (Sayornis saya)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Zach Gayk

One individual was observed at Bete Grise wetlands, Keweenaw Co., on 28 May 2007.

Say's Phoebe (Sayornis saya)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Philip C. Chu, Matt Hysell, Caleb G. Putnam, Jonathan

T. Wuepper

Photographs: Tim Baerwald, Byron Butler, Darlene Friedman, Matt Hysell, Kip Miller, Caleb G. Putnam

One individual was observed at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 20-24 November 2007.

Say's Phoebe (Sayornis saya)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Joseph Youngman Photographs: Max Henschell

One individual was observed at Sturgeon River Sloughs Wildlife Area, Baraga/Houghton Cos., on 29 September 2008.

Vermilion Flycatcher (Pyrocephalus rubinus)

Vote: 7-0, in the second round Description: Mrs. James A. Hewins (typed by James A. Hewins)

One individual, a male (probably an adult), was observed at Fraser, Macomb Co., on 12 November 1972. This record was initially accepted with a 5-2 vote (Chu 1992), and was re-reviewed using the current standard of acceptance, as described in the introduction. Initial concerns over the perceived second-hand nature of the writeup were allayed by the fact that the observer, Mrs. Hewins, signed the report.

Scissor-tailed Flycatcher (Tyrannus forficatus)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Kelli Heindel Levinson

One individual was observed from Whitefish Point to Paradise, Chippewa Co., on 2-3 June 2008.

Loggerhead Shrike (Lanius ludovicianus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Chris Neri Photographs: Chris Neri

One individual was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 24 September 2007.

Loggerhead Shrike (Lanius ludovicianus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Caleb G. Putnam Photographs: Rick Brigham, Adam M. Byrne, Skye Haas, Max Henschell, Caleb G. Putnam

One individual was observed north of Stonington, Delta Co., on 25 April-3 May 2008.

Bell's Vireo (Vireo bellii)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Caleb G. Putnam
Photographs: Adam M. Byrne, Allen
T. Chartier, Robert Epstein, Brad
Murphy, Caleb G. Putnam
Audio Recording: Allen T. Chartier

One individual was observed at Beaudette Park, Oakland Co., on 26 April-2 May 2008.

Violet-green Swallow (Tachycineta thalassina)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Skye Haas, Caleb G.

Putnam

Photographs: Rick Brigham, Adam M. Byrne, Max Henschell, David Pavlik, Caleb G. Putnam

One female, a first state record, was observed at Marquette, Marquette Co., on 27-29 April 2008.

Cave Swallow (Petrochelidon fulva)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Chris Neri, Kirk Zufelt

One individual was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 21 October 2007.

Rock Wren (Salpinctes obsoletus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Tom Auer Photographs: Tom Auer

One individual was observed at Sturgeon River Sloughs Wildlife Area, Baraga/Houghton Cos., on 22 May 2008.

Bewick's Wren (Thryomanes bewickii)

Vote: 6-1

One individual was observed at Benzonia, Benzie Co., on 10 May 2008.

Northern Wheatear (Oenanthe oenanthe)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Scott Hickman, Caleb

G. Putnam

Photographs: Skye Haas, Scott Hickman, Caleb G. Putnam, Barbara Tompkins

One individual was observed at Grand Marais, Alger Co., on 6 June 2008.

Sage Thrasher (Oreoscoptes montanus)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Jonathan T. Wuepper, John Wuepper

Photographs: Jonathan T. Wuepper

One individual was observed at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 30 October 2007.

Western Tanager (Piranga ludovicianus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Skye Haas

One adult male was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 13 May 2008.

Western Tanager (Piranga **ludovicianus**)

in the second round

Description: Lillian Heldreth

Two individuals, a male and a presumed female, were reported at Marquette, Marquette Co., on 9 May 2008. The male was accepted, but the female was rejected (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

Spotted Towhee (Pipilo maculatus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Scott Hickman

Photographs: Scott Hickman, Max

Henschell

One individual was observed at AuTrain, Alger Co., on 27-28 September 2007.

Spotted Towhee (Pipilo maculatus)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Rick Brigham, Matt Hysell, Michael Overway, John L. Trapp, Alison Világ, Jonathan T.

Wuepper

Photographs: Rick Brigham, Matt Hysell, Kip Miller, Michael Overway,

John L. Trapp

One individual was observed in Buchanan Twp., Berrien Co., on 31 January-8 February 2008.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Laurence C. Binford

One individual was observed at Agate Harbor,

Vote: 7-0, for one of two individuals Keweenaw Co., on 23 August 2007.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Skye Haas

One individual was observed at Marquette, Marquette Co., on 24 August 2007.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Dave Slager

Photographs: Caleb G. Putnam,

Dave Slager

One individual was observed at Muskegon, Muskegon Co., on 2-3 September 2007.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes arammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Skye Haas, Mark and Joanie Hubinger

One individual was observed at Shelter Bay, Alger Co., on 3 May 2008.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Scott Hickman Photographs: Jude Holloway,

Amanda Ingraham

One individual was observed at Munising, Alger Co., on 3 May 2008.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0, for one individual, 0-7,

for two individuals

Descriptions: Adam M. Byrne, Philip

C. Chu, Edward Tiede

Photograph: Karl Overman

Audio Recording: Allen T. Chartier

One individual was observed at Petersburg State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 6-22 May 2008. A second individual, reported by one of the observers but not by the others, was not accepted (see below under

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

"Records Not Accepted").

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Robert Seasor One individual was observed at Topaz, Ontonogan Co.,

on 7 May 2008.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Anita & Brad Blasius (via David J. Peters), Craig Lipski Photograph: Craig Lipski

One individual was observed at Tawas Point State Park, losco Co., on 18-22 May 2008.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: David Bell, Max

Henschell

One individual was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 25 May 2008.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 6-1, in the second round **Description: Frank Apsey** One individual was observed at Oscoda, losco Co., on 25 May 2008.

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 7-0

Photograph: Dick Verch One individual was observed near Wakefield, Gogebic Co., on 16 June 2008.

Lark Bunting (Calamospiza melanocorys)

Vote: 5-2

Photographs: Tom Auer, Art Weaver One male was observed at Oskar, Houghton Co., on 17-19 May 2008.

Lark Bunting (Calamospiza melanocorys)

Vote: 5-2, in the second round Description: Greg Mulligan

One male was observed at Manistique, Schoolcraft Co., on 17 May 2008.

Nelson's Sparrow (Ammodramus nelsoni)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Skye Haas

One individual was observed at Marquette, Marquette Co., on 11 October 2007.

Nelson's Sparrow (Ammodramus nelsoni)

Vote: 7-0

Descriptions: Adam M. Byrne, Brad Murphy

One individual was observed at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 26 May 2008.

Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow (Ammodramus nelsoni/caudacutus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Jonathan Vande Kopple Photographs: Jonathan Vande Kopple

One individual was observed at Muskegon State Game Area, Muskegon Co., on 26 May 2007. First rejected as Nelson's Sparrow (see below under "Records Not Accepted"), this record was here given reconsideration under a broader species grouping, concordant with MBRC practice.

Golden-crowned Sparrow (Zonotrichia atricapilla)

Vote: 7-0

Description: William Grigg

One individual was observed east of Alpena, Alpena Co., on 15 May 2007.

Blue Grosbeak (Passerina caerulea)

Vote: 7-0

Description: William Grigg One individual was observed east of Alpena, Alpena Co., on 19 May 2007.

Eurasian Tree Sparrow (Passer montanus)

Vote: 7-0, for one individual, 6-1, for two additional individuals Description: Laurence C. Binford, Joe Kaplan

Photographs: Zach Gayk Three individuals were observed at Copper Harbor, Keweenaw Co., on 5-11 May 2007.

Eurasian Tree Sparrow (Passer montanus)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Robert Seasor One individual was observed at Topaz, Ontonogan Co., on 31 May 2007.

Eurasian Tree Sparrow (Passer montanus)

Vote: 7-0

Photographs: Calvin Brennan, Chris Neri

One individual was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 7-8 May 2008.

Eurasian Tree Sparrow (Passer montanus)

Vote: 7-0

Description: Philip C. Chu

Photographs: Max Henschell, Chris

Neri

One individual was observed at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 25-29 May 2008.

Records Not Accepted

Black-bellied/Fulvous Whistling-Duck (Dendrocygna autumnalis/ bicolor)

Vote: 2-5 one description

One individual was reported at Round Lake, Lenawee Co., on 16 June 1988. This record was initially rejected as a Fulvous Whistling-Duck (Chu 1991), and was here given reconsideration under a broader grouping, consistent with current MBRC practice. The observer described a 20 inch tall duck standing in a tree top, gooselike in appearance (shape was also mentioned as similar to the shape of Green Heron (Butorides virescens)), with a tawny head and neck roughly 1/3 the height of the bird, blue-gray bill and legs, dark wings and back, white on its rump with a "narrow rim of black on its tail," and tawny underparts similar in color to the head and neck. Its vocalization was described as a

"muffled 'caw" rather than a clear whistle. While some members felt convinced that the description was a good match for Fulvous Whistling-Duck, most were troubled that the bird was roosting in a tree. This behavior is not common in Fulvous Whistling-Duck, a concern also cited by Chu (1991). Furthermore, and also in concordance with the earlier decision, the vocalization was deemed inconsistent with the species claimed. A final problem was the description of shape as similar to that of Green Heron.

"Greenland" Greater Whitefronted Goose (Anser albifrons flavirostris)

Vote: 0-7, for two individuals one description

Two individuals, both adults, were reported at Willow Metropark, Wayne Co., on 25 November 2007. The observer noted "dark barring on the lower breast and belly" and an "orangecolored bill versus the pink bills of the other subspecies." Members were unanimous in the opinion that the former field mark is typical of all adult Greater White-fronted Geese, and thus not helpful in determining the subspecies (without more detail on extent and pattern of barring). Members also argued that bill color, though suggestive of flavirostris, should not be considered diagnostic (Kaufman 1994), as

some individuals are intermediate between subspecies, and occasional individuals of other subspecies show orange bills as well.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 3-4, for one individual in the first round, 4-3, for a second individual in the second round one description photographs

Two individuals, both pale morph juveniles, were reported at Tawas City, losco Co., on 26 October 2007. Dissenting members felt the birds were possibly hybrid Snow Geese X Ross's Geese due to uncomfortably large body size (judged to be too large in comparison to nearby Canada Geese (Branta canadensis)), the heavy, non-triangular bills, the slightly convex facial feathering/bill base interface, and the presence of a small "grin patch" on the tomia of the two birds.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 3-4 one description photographs

One individual, a pale morph adult, was reported at Kalamazoo, Kalamazoo Co., on 28-29 January 2008. The bird was described as approximately the size of a Mallard or slightly larger, with a short, stubby bill with a grayish base, no "grin line," and an "almost

vertical and very slightly convex" curvature to the facial feathering/bill base juncture. Some argued that the bird appeared petite with all of the necessary features for this species, while others were concerned about the slight albeit clear curvature to the bill base/facial feathering interface, visible in the photos and noted by the observer, which was interpreted as leaving open the possibility of a Snow Goose X Ross's Goose hybrid or backcross.

Ross's Goose (Chen rossii)

Vote: 3-4 photographs

One individual, a pale morph adult, was reported at Ann Arbor, Washtenaw Co., on 28 February 2008. The bird was not described in writing, but multiple photos were provided by two observers. The committee was split on this record, with several members of the opinion that the bird's traits were not out of range of Ross's Goose. Most, however, felt that the following features were incorrect for Ross's Goose, and suggestive of a hybrid Snow Goose X Ross's Goose or backcross: the bill was proportionately too long and bulky, the "grin patch" was too broad, and the bill base/facial feathering interface was not straight enough, instead being curved convexly forward slightly. Finally,

one of the two observers also voiced the concern that this bird was potentially a hybrid in written correspondence.

Brant (Branta bernicla)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported in Au Sable Twp., losco Co., on 17 April 2008. The bird was described as being the size of a Mallard (Anas platyrhynchos) and all-black, except for a white belly and "white stripes on side of neck." Members unanimously felt the description was inconsistent with the species claimed. Several members mentioned that the report never clearly identified the bird as a waterfowl. Further, Brants are not uniformly black; they have gray mantles and flanks which contrast paler than the black neck and head, and they have strikingly white uppertail coverts. They are also slightly longer and considerably heavier than Mallards. Finally, the description did not identify where the white neck stripes were located, and how extensive they were. Several members voiced the concern that a domesticed duck could fit the description.

Barnacle Goose (Branta leucopsis)

Vote: 0-7 two descriptions photographs

One individual, an adult, was reported in Galien Twp., Berrien Co., on 30 April-4 May 2008. The committee at large agreed with the idenfication of the bird, but all questioned its origin as a natural vagrant. Specifically, the bird was seen to have a band on its right leg that "perhaps had some red that was washed/faded over time." The presence of bands on Nearctic Barnacle Geese does not necessarily preclude the possibility of natural vagrancy, as illustrated by a 2004 hunter-shot bird from Ontario that had been banded in Scotland. However, the presence of a red band, many members argued, would more likely represent that of a captive band. Finally, at least two members expressed some reservation about the bird's identification, stating that a hybrid Barnacle Goose X Canada Goose may not be fully ruled out without more detail.

Eurasian Wigeon (Anas penelope)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, a drake, was reported at Oscoda, losco
Co., on 18 April 2008. The bird was described as the size of an American Wigeon (Anas americana), with a grayish bill, a "chocolet [sic] colored head and breast that are contrasty," a "tan head crown," a "black stern with white ahead of it," and a light gray body. Members

were unanimous in the opinion that the description was inconsistent with a drake Eurasian Wigeon, which would never exhibit a chocolatecolored head. Instead, this bird should show an orange-red head with a creamy or buff-colored forecrown and a pinkish breast.

Barrow's Goldeneye (Bucephala islandica)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, a male, was reported at Omena, Leelanau Co., on 23 November 2007. The bird was said to have white on the face "extending up past the eye and ending in an almost sharp point." The observer did not describe the pattern of the forward portion of the flanks nor any other field marks. Members shared the unanimous opinion that more field marks were necessary to rule out the possibility of a hybrid Common Goldeneye (B. clangula) X Barrow's Goldeneye, which can share the facial crescent of Barrow's but show an intermediate "shoulder spur," head shape, and scapular pattern.

Barrow's Goldeneye (Bucephala islandica)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, a male, was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 18 February 2008. The observer described a bird with a "classic long

white crescent on each side of the face extending above the eyes," "very little white" in the flanks, and a completely dark back. Members unanimously agreed that a hybrid Common Goldeneye X Barrow's Goldeneye could not be ruled out without a more detailed description of shoulder spur, mantle, scapular pattern, and other field marks. Further, several members also felt that the description given was potentially inconsistent with Barrow's Goldeneye. Specifically, all drake Barrow's Goldeneyes should exhibit a pale yellow eye, yet the observer reports eyes which were "sometimes as dark as the head." The observer also appears to suggest that the flanks and mantle were entirely black, another problematic claim for any drake.

Pacific Loon (Gavia pacifica)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Glen Haven, Leelanau Co., on 12 May 2008. The observer described a loon about 25% smaller than nearby Common Loons (Gavia immer) with a more slender bill, "very light gray from the top of the head running down the back of its neck," "a very dark black throat that contrasted greatly with its head," and a white belly. Members were troubled by the inability to age this individual from the information presented.

Although the dark throat would suggest an adult, the description of the back as dark would be a better fit for a first summer Arctic (G. arctica) or Pacific Loon. At least two members felt that a dark throat and dark back were characteristics of an alternate adult Red-throated Loon (G. stellata). Others did not invoke this possibility but pointed out that the lack of description of the flank pattern left one unable to rule out Arctic Loon. This record was subsequently reconsidered as Arctic/Pacific Loon (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

Arctic/Pacific Loon (Gavia arctica/pacifica)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One individual was reported at Glen Haven, Leelanau Co., on 12 May 2008. This record was initially rejected as Pacific Loon (see above under "Records Not Accepted"), and here given reconsideration under a broader grouping, per current MBRC practice. Several members felt the description was acceptable for this grouping, but the majority still had concerns that an adult Redthroated Loon not only failed to be eliminated, but that it was indeed a better fit for the description: a small loon with a dark throat and gray back. Any Arctic/Pacific Loon with a dark throat (i.e. an aftersecond-year), they argued, would have obvious white patches on the scapulars.

Arctic/Pacific Loon (Gavia arctica/ pacifica)

Vote: 0-7 photographs video footage

One individual was captured at Ottawa National Forest, Gogebic Co., on 1 October 2008. All members felt the photos and video footage appeared to show a Red-throated Loon.

Western Grebe (Aechmophorus occidentalis)

Vote: 0-7, for two individuals one description

Two individuals were reported at Port Huron, St. Clair Co., on 14 October 1975. A second-hand author described the circumstances of the sighting and included the following description of the birds: large size, slender neck and head, and "difference in bill shape." Members were troubled by the second hand nature of the report; indeed, many members voiced the opinion that such documentation ought never be accepted. Further, all agreed that the cursory description was insufficient to rule out many other waterbird species.

Brown Pelican (Pelecanus occidentalis)

Vote: 2-5, for four individuals one description

Four individuals, believed to be in their first year, were reported at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 30 July 2008. The observer described four very large, evenly-brown birds flying in formation (V-shaped at times) directly away from the observer, such that the birds' bills could not be seen. Most members felt that Double-crested Cormorant (Phalacrocorax auritus) (especially brown juveniles) could not be ruled out without more information on bill and head morphology. The report mentioned that the birds had slower wingbeats than those of Double-crested Cormorants, but by the observer's admission there was no direct comparison available. Most members also felt that the other key features mentioned (all brown upperparts including rump/ uppertail and nape, broad wings with slightly darker primaries, flight behavior including bursts of gliding with brief altitude gains) were not inconsistent with Double-crested Cormorants.

Magnificent Frigatebird (Fregata magnificens)

Vote: 1-6 one description

One individual, either a female or subadult male, was reported at Au Train Lake, Alger Co., on 6 September 2007. The observer described an all-black bird with a white bib soaring high above the lake with Turkey Vultures (Cathartes aura). It had a "deeply forked long tail which opened and closed," long narrow wings and bill, and no noticeable markings on the head. Members mostly agreed that the report likely referred to a frigatebird, but most also argued that other frigates could not be ruled out on the description provided, including Great and Lesser Frigatebirds (F. minor and F. ariel, respectively). This report was subsequently accepted as Fregata species. (See above under "Records Accepted.")

Tricolored Heron (Egretta tricolor)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Shiawassee National Wildlife Refuge, Saginaw Co., on 22 July 2007. The observer described a bird approximately 1/3 smaller than a Great Blue Heron, with a "deeper blue on the back and flank area," and a more sharply contrasting white throat and neck than that of the Great Blue Heron. At least two members commented that Tricolored Heron doesn't have blue in the flanks, instead being white here. Others were troubled by the inability to rule out a Snowy Egret (E. thula) X Tricolored Heron, a combination

known to have been present in the Saginaw Bay area (Byrne 2001). A more detailed description of soft parts coloration, belly color, and the exact pattern of the face may have clarified the matter.

Glossy Ibis (Plegadis falcinellus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Nayanquing Point State Wildlife Area, Bay Co., on 28 May 2008. The observer described a 2 ft. or taller bird, "darker blue/ brown/purple" in color, with a "long curved beak," no white on the face, and "tannish" legs. It also was said to utter a "duck quack-like sound." Members felt that the description was inconsistent with the species claimed, as all Glossy Ibises at this time of year have at least some "indistinct pale lines" on the loral area (Pyle 2008). At least two members also felt the description of leg color was inappropriate for the species claimed. This record was subsequently reconsidered as Plegadis ibis (see above under "Records Accepted").

White-faced Ibis (Plegadis chihi)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Harsen's Island, St. Clair Co., on 16 October 2007. The observer described a bird slightly smaller than a crow which

"looked completely black" with a "salt and pepper" head pattern. The observer did not, however, describe the bird's body shape or bill, but claimed only that it was a "perfect fit for an ibis." Members unanimously agreed that not enough detail was provided to eliminate Glossy Ibis or several other species. Without a description of leg length, bill shape, and body shape, for example, it is not clear that the bird was a wading bird. Further, no Plegadis ibis is actually black; rather, they are brown with varying degrees of reddish and greenish iridescence in the body and wings. The committee ruled, as it has in the past, that it is not comfortable accepting records on assertion ("perfect for an ibis"). This record was reconsidered as a Plegadis ibis following this decision (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

Plegadis ibis (Plegadis sp)

Vote: 2-5 one description

Eleven individuals were reported at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 20 May-22 July 2007. Ten of these birds were accepted in 2008, with the eleventh individual not accepted because it lacked documentation (Putnam 2008). Here, new documentation of this individual was discovered, in which a single observer claimed to have seen a flock of 12 Plegadis ibises in flight,

early on the morning of 10 June (11 *Plegadis* ibises were already accepted for this date: 10 Glossy lbises and 1 White-faced lbis). The observer does not describe the 12th *Plegadis* ibis, however, stating only that they counted a flock of ibises of that number. Members were divided, some feeling that the claim was sufficient to establish the 12th bird, but most were concerned that because the purported new individual wasn't described it was unclear whether it was a *Plegadis* ibis.

Plegadis ibis (Plegadis sp)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Harsen's Island, St. Clair Co., on 16 October 2007. Initially rejected as a White-faced lbis (see above under "Records Not Accepted"), this record was given reconsideration as a broader species grouping. However, as in the prior decision, members remained uncomfortable with the lack of description of bill shape and length, the description of the bird as "a little smaller than a crow" (it should be as large or larger). and the over-reliance on assertion rather than providing a detailed description.

Plegadis ibis (Plegadis sp.)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Fish Point State Wildlife Area, Tuscola Co., "on about 15 October 2007." The observer described using body and bill size and shape to identify the bird, but never described what those sizes and shapes were. The bird was mentioned to have had no white in its plumage. Members unanimously agreed that there was too little description for acceptance.

Plegadis ibis (Plegadis sp.)

Vote: 2-5, for one individual one description

Two individuals were reported in Saugatuck Twp., Allegan Co., on 15 November 2008. The first individual, documented by photographs, was accepted (see above under "Records Accepted"). However, the second individual was not described, with all language in the report in the singular and no reference to the purported second individual provided.

Black Vulture (Coragyps atratus)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One was reported at Melvin, Sanilac Co., on 9 May 2008. The observer reported a bird with an all-black underside except for "light grayish" primaries, "flappier" flight style than that of Turkey Vulture, broader wings

than those of Turkey Vulture, and a smaller and more compact body than that of Turkey Vulture. Several members were satisfied with this description, but most argued that the report lacked sufficient detail for confirmation. In particular, there was no description of the tail, it was unclear exactly what part of the underprimary area was grayish, and there lacked a definitive description of head color (just that red was not seen).

Black Vulture (Coragyps atratus)

Vote: 0-7, for two individuals one description

Two were reported 3 miles north of Adrian, Lenawee Co., on 15 August 2008. The observer reported 1 to 2 ft. tall birds standing on the ground. Their "feathers were black with no noticeable pattern," and their heads dihedral angle while soaring, a and chins/throats were "black without feathers." The tails were described as very short, and the bill as having a light tip, though it was not specified whether one or both individuals possessed this trait. Members nearly unanimously felt that juvenile Turkey Vultures were not ruled out. First, none of the features mentioned are incorrect for this age class of Turkey Vulture except for the pale bill tip, which may have only been present on one individual. Further, the sighting was possibly made from a moving vehicle (nothing is said of what

the observer was doing during the sighting, but the birds were seen near "a secondary road in a cut grain field," suggesting the possibility that the observer was driving), and no optics were used. This led most members to question whether the light bill tip may have been due to lighting or discoloration from carrion or mud, or possibly even to age transition in a juvenile Turkey Vulture transitioning into adulthood.

Black Vulture (Coragyps atratus)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One was reported at Lake Erie Metropark, Wayne Co., on 16 October 2008. The observer reported a bird 2/3 to 3/4 the size of a Turkey Vulture with blocky, rectangular and broad wings, no uniform black appearance (seen at a height of 500 feet), a head that was "not large," and a very short tail. The observer also mentioned being 99.9% certain of the identification, and that although they did not observe any white in the underwing, they were not sure it was absent. The committee was split, with almost half of the members satisfied with the identification. Dissenters cited the observer's uncertainty of the identification (i.e. why wasn't the observer 100% sure?), the lack of description of head size and

feathering, and the lack of any observed flapping behavior as giving pause.

Ferruginous Hawk (Buteo regalis)

Vote: 2-5 one description

One individual, apparently a light morph, was reported at Port Crescent State Park, Huron Co., on 17 April 2008. The observer reported a "big, eaglelike" bird, light-colored with "three points of light" when seen at a distance, big head, long wings, white "underbody," white tail with undefined dark terminal band, "commas," and "leggings" that "fused into the semblance of a belly band." The bird also had "no patagium." Some members felt the description, which although suggestive, was insufficient to rule out "Krider's" Red-tailed Hawk. The only field mark potentially wrong for a Krider's Red-tailed Hawk was the "leggings," but the observer never specified whether the leggings were dark or pale, only that the bird had them. Other members felt the description was inconsistent with the species claimed or at least incomplete. Specifically, there was no elaboration of what was meant by the "three points of light," and the critical details of upper primary and primary coverts pattern were not provided. Lastly, one observer pointed out that a terminal tail band could match a

young Ferruginous Hawk (but not an adult), yet such a bird would not have "leggings."

Prairie Falcon (Falco mexicanus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 13 October 2007. The observer described a large falcon with "creamy, paler brown" color and with "the white of the cheek [reaching] to behind the eye." Members unanimously felt that the description was insufficient to rule out Peregrine Falcon (F. peregrinus), in particular juvenile Peregrines of the race tundrius, which match the description quite closely.

Black Rail (Laterallus jamaicensis)

Vote: 2-5, for one individual two descriptions

Two individuals were reported in Royalton Twp., Berrien Co., on 13-24 May 2007. The first was accepted (see above under "Records Accepted"). The report consisted of five heard-only observations, only two of which were believed to include a second individual. The evidence for the second individual was that the observers claimed to hear two birds calling at a distance of 50 yards or more apart within seconds of one another. While some members were swayed by this, others felt that the judgment of the number of

calling individuals was subject to significant subjective error stemming from the ventriloqual properties of rail vocalizations (e.g., a bird which turns its head away from the observer often sounds much farther than when facing the observer), and the possibility that the bird was simply moving around quickly between vocalizations.

King Rail (Rallus elegans)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at "a back road in the Houghton Lake area," presumably in Roscommon Co., on 9 June 2006. The observer described a heard-only observation in which a bird was heard calling in response to a taped broadcast, and that it sounded "just like the tape [of King Rail]". Members were unanimously troubled by the lack of description of what was heard, rather than the assertion that it sounded like the recording of King Rail. Several vocalizations of the Virginia Rail can be extremely similar to those of the King Rail.

King Rail (Rallus elegans)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 16 May 2008. The observer described a heard-only observation in which a repeated "kik kik kik kik kik" was given every 0.90 seconds. Members expressed concern that the description alone was insufficient to rule out Virginia Rail, as this species does occasionally give short snippets of repeated single notes. The observer did not specify how long the bouts of call lasted. One member expressed being uneasy about how the call frequency was actually measured, and if estimated how much error in that number is possible.

King Rail (Rallus elegans)

Vote: 0-7, for one of two individuals one description

Two were reported at Bay-Arenac Rd., Bay & Arenac Cos., on 27 June 2008. One of the two individuals was accepted (see above under "Records Accepted"), but the second individual was not sufficiently documented. The observer described having thought there were two birds calling simultaneously, but provided no description of the second individual. Members unanimously agreed that at least a basic description of the bird was necessary to rule out other rail species, as well as some description of the circumstances leading to the conclusion that there were actually two birds present. Rails often have ventriloqual properties to their voices, allowing one bird to sound like two by simply turning its head.

King Rail (Rallus elegans)

Vote: 0-7, in the second round one description

One was reported at Chelsea State Game Area, Washtenaw Co., on 15 June 2008. The bird was described as having the "classic rail shape," a long thin bill, large body size, a black-banded belly, a reddish throat, a brownish back, and as being "significantly larger" than an American Woodcock (Scolopax minor) which was "visible at about the same distance." Although most members felt the details were suggestive of King Rail, most felt that the description of size was the key determinant of this record's fate. After some discussion, it was brought up that the wording used to describe the bird's size in relation to an American Woodcock did not specify whether the two birds were near one another; it was possible that the woodcock and the rail were in separate directions from one another. At least one member reported having been deceived in the field by large-appearing Virginia Rails and Soras (Porzana carolina), and most members felt that it was necessary to know that there had indeed been a direct size comparison. Finally, several members argued that a reddish throat was a better match for Virginia Rail than for King Rail.

American Oystercatcher (Haematopus palliatus)

Vote: 0-7, for 17 individuals, 1-6 for 12 individuals, and 2-5 for 2 individuals two descriptions

"Approximately 17" individuals were reported at New Buffalo, Berrien Co., on 6 July 2008. The birds were described as having orange bills and black heads (which extended down to the breast "like a hood"), medium brown upperparts, a "full white wing stripe extending from the tertials to the primaries," clean white underparts, and as being "about the same size as the Marbled Godwits (Limosa fedoa), maybe a touch smaller." One individual was described as having an orange orbital ring and an orangish iris. Not observed or described were tail/rump pattern or leg color. Most members felt that the plumage details provided, though incomplete, did suggest the species claimed, and at least two members accepted at least one individual. However, most felt that the claim of these birds, a would-be first state record, anywhere on the Great Lakes is so extraordinary that it requires very strong documentation. This species is strictly marine, and inland sightings in many Atlantic coastal states are notable if not unheard of. Knowledge of this fact was not acknowledged by the

observers, one of whom indicated they spent more time identifying the accompanying Marbled Godwits than focusing on the oystercatchers. This troubled several members who felt that adequate attention to these birds may not have been paid. Further, although the birds were seen at length, the fact that there was no mention of tail or rump pattern, leg color, or bill shape was troubling to many members. If such details as orbital ring color and wing stripe (seen in flight) were noted, why were these obvious field marks not recorded? Finally, at least three members were troubled by the description of size as similar to or slightly smaller than Marbled Godwits. This species is nearly twice the bulk (though similar in length) of Marbled Godwit, and should have appeared clearly larger. Though not a unanimous decision, these concerns left most members unable to accept the record.

Black-necked Stilt (Himantopus mexicanus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at "a flooded field off Baycreek Rd.," Monroe Co., on 25 May 1989. Members were unanimously concerned over the lack of description of the bird, other than to say that it was "large black and white shorebird." Most felt

that this did not eliminate American Avocet (Recurvirostra americana), American Oystercatcher, or potentially even other species.

Western Sandpiper (Calidris mauri) Vote: 0-7, for two individuals one description

Two individuals, believed to be adults, were reported at Pointe Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 5 August 2007. The birds were described as smaller than Baird's Sandpipers and lacking its attenuated appearance. They had longer bills than Semipalmated Sandpipers (C. semipalmatus), including a slight droop at the tip on one individual. They were overall grayer than the brownish Semipalmated Sandpipers nearby, with whitish faces and pale breasts, no rufous in the upperparts, and black legs. Members were troubled by apparent inconsistencies in this report and the opinion that Semipalmated Sandpiper could not be ruled out. Namely, the birds were described as adults. yet there is no mention of retained alternate flank chevrons, which most or all adult Western Sandpipers should still possess on that date. Upperpart coloration, the only other plumage feature to go on, is not enough by itself for this difficult identification. This left only the subjective judgment of bill shape and length (many female eastern Semipalmated Sandpipers have

longer bills than many Western Sandpipers) and overall gestalt, field marks which although suggestive are not conclusive enough to rule out Semipalmated Sandpiper.

Western Sandpiper (Calidris mauri)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, a juvenile, was reported in Kinderhook Twp., Branch Co., on 12 August 2007. The bird was described as having rufous scapulars and a long, tapered bill with a drooped tip. Members unanimously agreed that this description failed to rule out several other species of shorebirds, including Dunlin (C. alpina), Semipalmated Sandpiper, Least Sandpiper (C. minutilla), and Pectoral Sandpiper (C. melanotos), among others.

Western Sandpiper (Calidris mauri)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One individual, apparently juvenile, was reported at the Midland Cogeneration Venture Ponds, Midland Co., on 2 August 2008. The bird was described as diminutive in relation to Stilt Sandpiper (C. himantopus), with an "electric rufous scapular 'bar' on an otherwise gray/white bird," a light face with darker crown, no streaking on clean white underparts, black legs and bill, a barrel-chested Semipalmateds), and a long bill

appearance, and a long bill with a "Dunlin droop." The committee was almost evenly split on the record, some arguing that even a bright juvenile Semipalmated Sandpiper could not show the "eyepopping" rufous scapulars. The majority, however, argued that this description was too nebulous to fully rule out this possibility. Furthermore, the identification of this species, they argued, is reliant on many subjective characters (i.e. barrelchested shape, Dunlin-like bill, etc.) such that it is difficult to concretely rule out other species in a written description. Finally, bill length was not considered a diagnostic field mark as eastern female Semipalmated Sandpipers can have bills in excess of those of Western Sandpipers.

Western Sandpiper (Calidris mauri)

Vote: 1-6, for 2 to 5 individuals, 2-5, for 1 individual one description

Five individuals, all believed to be juveniles, were reported at Baraga Sewage Ponds, Baraga Co., on 16 August 2008. The birds were accompanied by 4-5 Semipalmated Sandpipers and several other shorebird species. They were described as "reddish brown above" and "grayish below," with a reddish-buff color on the side of the breast (as opposed to a medium brown on adjacent

with a droop towards the end ("at least one" individual). Other birds were described as having bills intermediate in length with the long-billed Western and the Semipalmateds, and the final two birds had bills "which looked very much like the Semipalmateds." Additional descriptive details were provided including that four of the five birds had incomplete breast bands (one being nearly complete), at least some rufous on upper scapular fringes (two with it very bright, two less so, and one more muted), and a "whiter, more open aspect to the face," including reddish buff auriculars. Responses of members varied considerably, and included some "accept" votes. The majority, however, voiced concerns over an inability to properly age these birds and their perception that the report was inconsistent and incomplete. The description of upperparts as reddish-brown above and gray below is incorrect for the species claimed. A juvenile Western Sandpiper should show a contrast between rufous upper scapulars (two rows) and grayish lower scapulars (two rows), not between the upperparts and underparts at large. Further, the description of the auriculars as reddish buff seemed more appropriate for an adult Western Sandpiper than a juvenile, yet the remainder of the description precludes this

possibility. For the remainder of the field marks, they argued, little other than subjective judgments of shape and gestalt were diagnostic in separating out Semipalmated Sandpipers.

Baird's Sandpiper (Calidris bairdii)

Vote: 1-6 one description photographs

One individual was reported at Muskegon Wastewater Management Complex, Muskegon Co., on 15 May 2008. The bird was described as follows: breast light brownish from fine streaking, white underparts, primaries extending beyond tail tip, bill black, straighter and heavier than that of Least Sandpiper, legs black, upperparts brown with black-centered scapulars, no reddishness in face or any other feathers, and larger than Least Sandpiper but smaller than Dunlin by weight. Members mostly felt that the description was suggestive, but that the two photos provided appeared to contradict the description. Specifically, the back end of the bird, visible in one photo, appeared bulky and lacked the tapered look typical of Baird's Sandpiper. Others argued that the primaries appeared not to extend beyond the tail tip, or that they appeared broad and blunt-tipped, rather than thin and pointed. Finally, the apparent lack

of a hind toe, combined with the previous shortcomings, led many to the opinion that a late-molting Sanderling could not be ruled out.

"Atlantic" Short-billed Dowitcher (Limnodromus griseus griseus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, believed to be an adult, was reported at Lake Erie Metropark, Wayne Co., on 13 August 2007. The bird was described as smaller-bodied and smaller-billed than nearby hendersoni Short-billed Dowitchers, with blackish "upper plumage," unstreaked dark crown, blackish mantle with some pale edgings, blackish scapulars with whitish edges, black tertials with whitish barring, gray upperwing coverts paler than the remainder of the upperparts, and "underparts not markedly different than the seven Henderson's." Although some members found the upperpart coloration suggestive, others argued that all adult dowitchers in August have reduced or absent pale fringes due to feather wear, and could be adequately described this way. The description of the underparts, most argued, was incorrect for L. g. griseus, which are more heavily spotted on the breast and more solidly white on the belly compared to L. g. hendersoni. Finally, the issue of subspecific identification in Short-billed

Dowitchers, already one of the more difficult problems in birding, is further confounded by the presence of *griseus* X *hendersoni* intergrades in northern Ontario (Pittaway 2009), the identification of which is unclear if not impossible.

Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus ridibundus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, age unclear, was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 26 April 2008. The bird was described as having black on the underwings extending from the primaries "to nearly halfway down the wing," and "a lighter bill than the (Bonaparte's Gulls)." Members were unanimously troubled by the lack of additional description, and the consequent inability to rule out Bonaparte's Gull (Chroicocephalus philadelphia), Little Gull (Hydrocoloeus minutus) or even several other species of gulls with the description given. Several members offered the desire for more information on body size in comparison to the Bonaparte's Gulls it was with, what was meant by "lighter" bill (color or size), and for clarification of the age of this individual. Finally, many members felt that the description of the underwing was incorrect for the species claimed, as the black on a Black-headed Gull's underwing is limited to the primaries.

Black-headed Gull (Chroicocephalus bill, dark eyes, yellow legs, and ridibundus) a dovelike expression in the hea

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, believed to be an adult in basic plumage, was reported at Muskegon, Muskegon Co., on 25 October 2008. The bird was described as a little larger than a Bonaparte's Gull but smaller than a Ring-billed Gull (Larus delawarensis), with a similar back and primary pattern to that of adjacent adult basic Bonaparte's Gulls, with "some black on the wingtips" that the observer surmised to be on the underside of the wing. Many members noted that adult basic Bonaparte's Gulls, not only Black-headed Gulls, have "some black on the wingtips," and that more detail was necessary to eliminate the former. Body size was considered to be suggestive. but without more detail on how close it was to the accompanying Bonaparte's Gulls this was considered only a secondary feature.

Mew Gull (Larus canus)

Vote: 1-6 one description

One individual, age unclear, was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 5 May 2008. The bird was described as smaller than a Ring-billed Gull, about the size of Little Gull or a bit larger, with a small, short unmarked yellow-green

a dovelike expression in the head and eyes. Members were nearly unanimous in the opinion that this description was incomplete and had at least one inconsistency with the species claimed. First, if the bird was close to the size of Little Gull, it would be too small for a Mew Gull, which is just smaller than a Ringbilled Gull but not nearly as small as Little Gull. Furthermore, there was no mention of the shade of the mantle in relation to nearby gulls of other species - it should have been darker than that of Ring-billed Gull. That said, one member felt the documentation was sufficient to establish its identification as a Mew Gull.

California Gull (Larus californicus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, wearing 1st alternate plumage, was reported at Crosswinds Marsh, Wayne Co., on 29 January 2008. The bird was described as being notably slender and long-winged in relation to nearby Herring Gulls (L. argentatus), with a two-toned bill (pink base, black tip), very pale pink or flesh legs, relatively dark and mottled pattern on the underparts and upperparts, whitishedged scapulars, dark greater coverts with "a lot of white" on the innermost 4-5 feathers, tertials dark and "lightly tipped with white,"

dark head with white forehead and chin/throat, and a dark "eyemask." Many members felt that the report was suggestive of the species and plumage claimed. However, most also agreed that this identification is very difficult due to the extensive variation with this age class of each species. Most of the non-gestalt field marks mentioned are not out of the range of variation of some 1st alternate Herring Gulls. Particularly once they've entered their second calendar year, many Herring Gulls attain a sharply-bicolored bill and become whiter on the face, and can also show a dark auricular. Gestalt was considered by most members to be a secondary feature, never diagnostic. Finally, many members wished for a more complete description that included the upperwing pattern (most critically the contrast of the inner primaries to the remainder of the wing), and the tail and rump/uppertail covert pattern, all of which are vital for any purported young California Gull.

California Gull (Larus californicus) Vote: 0-7, for three individuals one description

Three individuals, believed to be wearing adult plumage, were reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 12-15 April 2008. The birds were described as having mantles darker than those of Ring-billed Gulls, greenish-yellow legs, black eyes

surrounded by red "rings," both red and black on the mandible, and a gray stripe along the back edge of the underwings (one of three individuals only). Members were unanimously troubled by this report. First, the age was claimed to be adult yet there is nothing in the description to substantiate the claim. Many 2nd cycle or 3rd cycle individuals of the species would fit this description. This aside, there is no description of body size (larger or smaller than Ring-billed Gull?), primary pattern, or the extent of black in the primaries. Many members argued that Herring Gull (especially 3rd cycle individuals) could match the description, as this age class usually has both red and black on the bill, and a small percentage of all Herrings (or perhaps Herring hybrids) shows a noticeably darker mantle, fleshcolored leas, and darker-thannormal irises. Another member arqued that Lesser Black-backed Gull (L. fuscus) could not be eliminated, since it was not specified how much darker the mantle was than those of Ring-billed Gulls.

California Gull (Larus californicus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, purported to be wearing adult basic plumage, was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 24 April-10 May 2008. The bird was described as larger than a

Ring-billed Gull, with gray legs and feet, dark eyes, and a gray bill with a dark tip. Members were troubled by the inability to corroborate the claimed age of this bird by the plumage features presented. Accurate ageing is a prerequisite to the proper application of field marks in large white-headed gulls. That aside, some members argued that gray legs are inappropriate for any age of California Gull; they are pink in first cycle birds, and greenish-yellow to yellow in subsequent age classes. Assuming the observer aged the bird correctly as an adult (after third year), at least one member felt that a streaked head would represent an exceedingly late prealternate molt for the species claimed. Finally, a more detailed description which included primary pattern, mantle shade, and bill shape might have allowed reviewers to better eliminate other large white-headed gull species.

Slaty-backed Gull (Larus schistisagus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, age unclear, was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 27 May 2008. The observer described a gull nearly the size of a Herring Gull but "thicker looking," with a black back, smudged appearance to the head and neck ("washed out gray"), pink legs and

feet, yellow eyes, bill longer, thicker, and paler than that of Herring Gull, with "lots of white on back (trailing part) of wings." Members were troubled by the inability to age this bird prior to trying to ascertain its identity. Assuming it was an adult, most argued, a black back is incorrect for the species claimed; it actually has a dark gray back clearly paler than the blackish primaries. No other age class of Slaty-backed Gull has a black back either. The strong trailing edge to the wing was taken as a potentially supportive mark, but not diagnostic by itself, and nothing else in the report was specific to the species. Finally, several important field marks were not included in the report including especially the dorsal pattern of the primaries, the shade of the mantle in relation to other gulls, primary projection, and other field marks. Without this information, neither Great Blackbacked Gull (L. marinus) nor several gull hybrid combinations could be ruled out.

Caspian Tern (Hydroprogne caspia)

Vote: 3-4, for five individuals one description

Five individuals were reported at Port Huron, St. Clair Co., on 3 February 2008. The observer described seeing five terns flying 10 feet above the observers, with black legs, red-orange bills, black wing tips, and slightly forked

tails. The call was described as sounding different from that of "a gull" as well. Members were split on this record, with about half feeling there was no other species that could fit this description, while others were troubled by the lack of detail and apparent inconsistencies in the written description. At least one observer was curious whether the black on the wingtip was on the underwing, upperwing, or both. It was also not specified how large the birds were in relation to nearby Herring and Ring-billed Gulls, nor what color their crowns were, details which should have been visible given the observer's ability to assess leg and foot coloration. Additional details which were lacking included an assessment of any black on the bill, the shade of the mantle, and the extent of black on the wingtip.

Pomarine Jaeger (Stercorarius pomarinus)

. Vote: 0-7

one correspondence

photographs

One individual, believed to be a juvenile, was reported at Silver Beach, Berrien Co., on 8-10 October 2007. This bird, though initially thought by several observers to be a Pomarine Jaeger, was photographed during the second day of its stay, at which time two sharply-pointed central rectrix tips were clearly visible.

All but one of the observers subsequently withdrew their initial claim of Pomarine Jaeger. The dissenter provided additional correspondence that referenced a "dark nape and light upper-tail coverts," in addition to mention of several gestalt characteristics perceived as suggestive of Pomarine. The possibility of different individual jaegers each day was considered, but all agreed that the photos appeared to show the same bird (a contention shared by multiple observers who saw the bird on the first day of its visit). All also agreed that the identification was clinched as Parasitic Jaeger (S. parasiticus) by the clearly pointed central rectrix tips.

Pomarine Jaeger (Stercorarius pomarinus)

Vote: 0-7 one description photograph

One individual, believed to be a light morph juvenile, was reported at Port Huron, St. Clair Co., on 15 November 2008. This bird was described as a dark, bulky bird at least 19 inches in length, grayish-brown overall and "very dark on top," with a pale belly lightly barred in dull brown, dark but "creamy" head showing as paler than the neck, and a tail "boldly barred with dark brown and white." The observer also

noted that "no retrices were visible on the tail." Members felt that the age of the bird was not clearly established, because jaegers of any age class can lack central rectrix projection beyond the tail, and because the underwing pattern of this bird was not mentioned. That aside, the elimination of Parasitic and Long-tailed Jaegers (S. longicaudus) appeared to have been made primarily by subjective judgments of bulk, wing width, and flight style. Though suggestive, most members consider such subjective field marks to be inconclusive at best.

Long-tailed Jaeger (Stercorarius longicaudus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One juvenile was reported at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 6 September 2006. The bird was described as "very light" in overall color, with a "narrow look," narrow wings, barred underwing coverts, and a whitish head. Members unanimously felt that more detail was necessary to rule out all other species. It was never clearly established that this bird was not an immature gull, for example. Further, even if the bird were secured as a jaeger, neither Parasitic nor Pomarine Jaegers could be ruled out without additional characteristics. Both of these species have light morphs with barred underwing coverts (second calendar year jaegers also have barred underwing coverts per Olsen and Larsson 1997). Finally, the judgment of the breadth of the wings and body, although a supporting characteristic, is never diagnostic in jaeger identification. Important field marks that were not mentioned in this report include the shape and length of the central two rectrices, wingspan and bulk comparisons with nearby gulls (esp. Ring-billed Gull), and any supposed contrasts between the color of the forward part of the inner upperwing and the secondaries/ hand wing.

Long-tailed Jaeger (Stercorarius longicaudus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 13 October 2007. The observer describes taking the identification of a distant "dot chasing gulls" on the authority of other birders, and offers no description of the bird. Members unanimously felt that without a description of the bird, few other species could be ruled out.

Long-tailed Jaeger (Stercorarius longicaudus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, believed to be a juvenile, was reported in Hampton Twp., Bay Co., on 14 November 2007. The bird was described as dark above and light below, light-headed with no dark cap, in the Ring-billed or Herring Gull size range with "slender appearance," possessing strong white crescents on the underwing near the primary/secondary junction, exhibiting "little fingers" (central rectrices) extending beyond the tail more than just "stubs," with little or no white on the upperwing. Members unanimously argued that this description fails to rule out a Parasitic Jaeger, or perhaps even a Pomarine Jaeger. Most of the field marks claimed as inconsistent with Parasitic Jaeger are in fact not so. Specifically, some juvenile and subadult (an age class not ruled out by the description) Parasitic Jaegers show no cap, white only on the underprimaries, and relatively long central rectrix extension (second calendar year birds). Body size is unhelpful here as Pomarine Jaeger is actually closest to Ring-billed Gull in wingspan and bulk, while Longtailed and Parasitic average smaller but with some overlap in both measurements (Olsen and Larsson 1997, 2003). In the final analysis, potentially clinching characters such as central rectrix shape and contrast of the upper secondaries and hand wing to the forward portion of the

arm wing were not noted, and no additional diagnostic field marks were documented.

Eurasian Collared-Dove (Streptopelia decaocto)

Vote: 0-7, in the second round one description

One individual was reported at Twp. 47N 28W, Marguette Co., on 30 May 2007. The bird was described as a having "black webbing on the base of the outer tail feathers," dark gray undertail coverts, and dark primaries contrasting with the body, among other field marks. Members were nearly unanimous in the opinion that further detail of the extent of black in the outer web of the outer rectrices (R6) was necessary to eliminate a hybrid Eurasian Collared-Dove X African Collared-Dove (S. roseogrisea). Specifically, the black on pure Eurasian Collared-Doves extends distally well beyond the black on the inner web of the same feather, while hybrids lack the full extent of black in this regard (Romagosa and McEneaney 1999).

Barn Owl (Tyto alba)

Vote: 0-7 one description photographs

One was found dead in Baroda Twp., Berrien Co., on 31 August 2007. The identification of this individual was unanimously agreed to be of the species claimed. However, its known captive origin was grounds for rejection. The bird was found with a radio transmitter attached to its back and bands on its legs, which were traced to a DuPage Co., Illinois, captive release dating to earlier that summer.

Rufous Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus)

Vote: 0-7 one description photograph

One was reported "near Millington," Tuscola Co., on 29-30 September 2007. The observer reported a hummingbird with "a very rufous tail," "slightly lighter rufous lower back with a greenish upper back," rufous flanks, white breast, white gorget with black spots, and a small amount of rufous near the eye, especially above it. While all members agreed that this bird was clearly a Selasphorus, all also felt that Allen's Humminabird and could not be ruled out without a detailed description of the shape of the tip of the second rectrix and/ or in-hand measurements of rectrix width and other diagnostic features. This record was recirculated as Rufous/Allen's Hummingbird, and accepted (see above under "Records Accepted").

Rufous/Allen's Hummingbird (Selasphorus rufus/sasin)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at Manistique, Schoolcraft Co., on 30 May-1 June 2007. This record was first rejected as Rufous Hummingbird in 2007 (Putnam 2008). The bird was described as a "reddish brown hummingbird" with a white throat, black legs, and white rump. Although a reddish-brown hummingbird is suggestive of a male Rufous/Allen's Hummingbird, most members were uncomfortable with the description of a white rump, a trait not shared by any North American hummingbird species. Many were also troubled by the mention of a white throat, another field mark that is inconsistent with this plumage. The throat should be red unless the bird isn't a male, in which case being all reddishbrown would connote an aberrant plumage.

Selasphorus species (Selasphorus sp.)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at Manistique, Schoolcraft Co., on 30 May-1 June 2007. This record was first rejected as Rufous Hummingbird in 2007 (Putnam 2008), then as Rufous/Allen's Hummingbird (see above under "Records Not Accepted"). It was here given final reconsideration as the broadest

possible grouping, per current MBRC practice. Members, as they argued before, continued to express concern over the white rump, as it is incorrect for any *Selasphorus*. The previous concerns detailed in the prior decision also still applied.

American Three-toed Woodpecker (Picoides dorsalis)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One was reported at the Stoll Trail, Isle Royale National Park, Keweenaw Co., on 17 May 2008. The bird was described as having a "yellow patch on its head" and black and white stripes on its back. Given the limited description, most members felt that a xanthochroistic Hairy Woodpecker (P. villosus) or Downy Woodpecker (P. pubescens) could not be ruled out. Additional elaboration on face pattern and underpart pattern could have ameliorated this concern.

American Three-toed Woodpecker (Picoides dorsalis)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One was reported in Trout Lake Twp., Chippewa Co., on 30 August 2008. The bird was described as similar in size to Blackbacked Woodpecker, with "white and black bars on the sides," a "white barring pattern on the back," an obvious white eye stripe, black not brownish feathers (the report

does not specify which feathers), a white throat, solid black upperwing coverts, and a dark beak. The call note was described as short and low-pitched, and consisting of a single note. The committee was split on this record, with several members in support of the identification claimed. Dissenters were troubled by two common concerns. First, the species claimed is actually noticeably smaller than Blackbacked Woodpecker, not the same size. Second, the description of the wing coverts as fully black did not specify which wing coverts were actually assessed. If the bird's wrists were tucked underneath the flank feathers, as woodpeckers often do while foraging, the lateral coverts within each tract may not have been visible. It is these feathers in Yellow-bellied Sapsuckers that are white, not the medial coverts. This, in combination with no other field marks being inconsistent with a Yellow-bellied Sapsucker, led at least two members to conclude that the sapsucker was not fully ruled out.

Fork-tailed Flycatcher (Tyrannus savana)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at Troy, Oakland Co., on 10 June 2008. The bird was described as showing an "obvious fork tail," white breast, blue-gray coloration overall, black cap, and some brown coloration on the wings. The call, heard twice, was described as "squark" and "like a distress call." The sighting lasted for "approximately 1 second as it flew." Members were troubled by the very fleeting nature of the sighting, and questioned how accurately the field marks given could have been assessed in flight for such a short duration. Some were concerned by the blue-gray description of the back (which should be gray or blackish), while others mentioned that the apparent tail streamers could have been nest material being carried by a more common species such as Eastern Kingbird (Tyrannus tyrannus). Finally, the description of call note gave pause to at least two members, who felt it was inappropriate for the species claimed.

Scissor-tailed/Fork-tailed Flycatcher (Tyrannus forficatus/ savana)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One was reported at Troy,
Oakland Co., on 10 June 2008.
The bird was initially rejected as
Fork-tailed Flycatcher (see above
under "Records Not Accepted"),
but here given reconsideration as
a broader species grouping, per
current MBRC practice. Members
were again troubled by the extreme
brevity and circumstances of the

sighting (1 second, in flight only), citing the possibility that the bird was possibly a more common species carrying nest material. Some mentioned that the black cap eliminated Scissor-tailed Flycatcher from consideration, and since the record was already rejected as Fork-tailed Flycatcher, that the grouping must be rejected as well. Finally, the tail length was mentioned by the observer as being shorter than the observer had studied in field guides. Though juveniles (and adults with broken rectrices) of both species show shorter rectrices, many members were troubled by this admission. One observer felt the description also didn't rule out escaped exotic species such as Pin-tailed Whydah (Vidua macroura).

Loggerhead Shrike (Lanius Iudovicianus)

Vote: 2-5 one description

One individual was reported in Port Austin Twp., Huron Co., on 13 June 2007. The bird was seen at a distance of about 1/4 mile, and was described as being the size of an American Robin (Turdus migratorius) or Eastern Kingbird, gray above and whitish below, with black wings and tail, and a black mask. The cap and back were medium-dark gray, and the bill was all-black. Heat shimmer and distance prevented the

observer from assessing underpart barring, paleness at the base of the bill, the shape of the bill tip, and other traits. All members gareed that the field marks mentioned clearly indicated a shrike, but all also agreed that Northern Shrike could not be ruled out by plumage with the details presented. Still, some were content to accept using either date of occurrence or date plus fence-perching behavior as clinching aids. The remainder of the committee, although in agreement that a shrike during mid-June was far more likely a Loggerhead than a Northern, also felt uncomfortable relying solely on this criterion to establish the identification.

Loggerhead Shrike (Lanius ludovicianus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Montgomery, Branch Co., on 25 September 2007. The observer described a bird just smaller than an American Robin. with a gray back, gray back of head, "very black" eye mask, and downcurved beak. Members unanimously felt that Northern Shrike (Lanius excubitor) could not be ruled out, even though the date and location would appear to connote an unlikely setting for this species. Some members felt that the description of the bill was inconsistent with either

shrike species, and that the lack of description of the extent of the black mask opened the door to Northern Mockingbird (*Mimus* polyglottos) as well.

Loggerhead Shrike (Lanius ludovicianus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Merrill, Saginaw Co., on 19 November 2007. The observer described a bird with gray upperparts, "stubby bill," wide black mask extending across the forehead and through the eye, black wings with white patch at the base of the primaries, grayishwhite underparts, and black tail. All members felt that Northern Shrike was not sufficiently ruled out. Receiving particular attention were the lack of description of the presence/absence of underpart barring and the presence/absence of black at the bill base, both of which should have been visible at the reported distance of 30 yards. Also troublesome, some argued, was that the observer never alluded to having considered Northern Shrike as an alternative explanation, only Northern Mockingbird, despite the date.

Loggerhead Shrike (Lanius ludovicianus)

Vote: 2-5 one description

One individual was reported in Au Sable Twp., losco Co., on 10 June 2008. The bird was described as about robinsized, with black wings with white patches visible in flight, slim, white body, black "feet," a black mask completely encompassing the eyes, black over the top of the mandible, and a "very bright white breast." Although two members were satisfied with the documentation, most were troubled by apparent inconsistencies in the report. First. it was unclear how the observer was able to judge whether the black mask fully encompassed the eye and bridged across the top of the maxilla with binoculars at a distance of "50-100 feet," and yet be unable to establish upperpart coloration, culmen hook shape and length, rump/uppertail pattern, and vent pattern. Further, the underparts were described as "very bright white," something deemed by many members to be incorrect for the species claimed, which is typically very grayish here. Finally, many members refused to rule out Northern Shrike just by date. Although a June shrike in the Lower Peninsula is most likely a Loggerhead, some members argued that date alone should not be used to eliminate this species, especially in light of recent mid-summer records of Snowy Owl (Bubo scandiaca) in the Lower Peninsula.

Black-capped Vireo (Vireo atricapilla)

Vote: 0-7, for two individuals one description photograph

Two individuals, a male and a female, were reported at North Point Conservation Area, Van Buren Co., on 23 May 2008. The observer described two "warbler-vireo sized" birds with medium to dark green backs which contrasted lighter than the head of each bird, "unstreaked off-white underparts," white spectacles, and light yellow wing bars. The head of the purported male was "an even black" with a lighter throat, and that of the female "a charcoal gray." Members unanimously felt the report was incomplete, and several argued that Blue-headed Vireo (V. solitarius) could not be eliminated from contention, or was indeed suggested as the actual identity of the bird. First, there was no mention of white lores or red irises, two conspicuous and important characters for the species claimed. Secondly, the photo appeared to contradict the claim by showing a grayish crown (rather than black). Though the report was suggestive, all members felt it fell short of eliminating all other species, especially Blue-headed Vireo.

Cassin's Vireo (Vireo cassinii)

Vote: 3-4 one description sketch

One individual was reported at Woldumar Nature Center, Eaton Co., on 10 May 2008. The observer described a 5-6 inch passerine with distinct, bright white spectacles, wholly grayish upperparts with a slight greenish tinge on the back up to the nape, "no distinct contrast or demarcation between the back and nape (head)," two distinct wing bars, dull yellowish sides, grayish auriculars and sides of neck "(blending) into the white of the throat," and a very dark loral area that stood out as darker than the remainder of the face. Nearly the entire committee felt this report was suggestive of the species claimed. Some felt that these marks adequately ruled out both Plumbeous (V. plumbeus) and Blue-headed Vireos, and all other species. Others, however, pointed out one discrepancy between the description and the literature. Classic Cassin's Vireos have heads that are "gray mixed with green or all green" (Heindel 1996). The observer specifically mentions that this bird's head was grayish, with the green tints of the back ending at the nape. While no member claimed that this necessarily negated the possibility that this bird could have been a Cassin's Vireo.

they did argue for conservatism in accepting such extralimital claims considering the large amount of variation in the "Solitary Vireo" complex and resultant unidentifiable individuals. At least one member even guoted Heindel (1996), who stated that "out-of-range birds should be identified with caution. I have held specimens for which racial identification was uncertain. Some birds will simply not be identifiable to subspecies in the field." To this end, they argued, extralimital individuals not matching up to the classic definition of Cassin's Vireo ought not be accepted.

Cave Swallow (Petrochelidon fulva)

Vote: 2-5 one description

One individual was reported at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 4 October 2007. The observer described a buffyrumped swallow with light-colored forehead and "a very small amount of dark feathering on the upper chest" and "throat." Most members were troubled by the lack of clarity as to what color the auriculars were, arguably the most vital trait for separating all sex and age classes of Cave Swallow from Cliff Swallow (P. pyrrhonota). The observer's description doesn't mention this feature, and the sketch appears to show the auriculars as buffy, but doesn't clearly articulate whether

this was specifically intended or whether the sketch was meant just to show the overall color pattern of the bird. Some observers were satisfied with the sketch, but most felt that it was not clear what color the auriculars of the bird actually were. Many members also felt that the dark markings in the throat were more suggestive of juvenile Cliff Swallow, and perhaps wrong for Cave Swallow.

Rock Wren (Salpinctes obsoletus) Vote: 1-6

one description

One individual was reported at the mouth of the Au Sable River, losco Co., on 8 May 2008. The observer mentioned a "light sandy color" with a "very light sprinkle of dark spots [on the] wings and body," streaks on throat, bill long and decurved, buff belly and tail, slight streaks behind eyes, and feet/legs gray. The bird was heard to emit "lots of 'te' sounds". Most members were troubled by apparent inconsistencies in the description. Namely, the description of the tail as buffy was inappropriate for this species, which, they argued, has a brown or gray tail with buffy spots. Secondly, the streaked throat is incorrect for the species claimed, as it instead has an unstreaked white throat. Finally, several members felt that nothing in the description clearly placed the bird in the songbird category,

as several non-passerine species were consistent with the description offered.

Bewick's Wren (Thryomanes bewickii)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported in Au Sable Twp., losco Co., on 3-24 June 2008. The observer described a bird the size of a House Sparrow (P. domesticus) with a brown coloration similar to that of House Sparrow, a bill "long and curved like Brown Creeper (Certhia americana)," light colored stripe over and extending behind eyes, and a long tail with "a little bit of white on edge on tip." The bird's song was described as "high like [the] middle part of Song Sparrow's song, sometimes with two additional notes following." Members felt that Carolina Wren (Thryothorus Iudovicianus), and perhaps even Marsh or Sedge Wrens (Cistothorus palustris and C. platensis, respectively) could not be fully eliminated from contention. Specifically, the observer mentioned separating the bird from Carolina Wren because the Bewick's Wren was "narrower in body length." Members were confused by this statement and whether it referred to body width or length. Nothing else in the description was inconsistent, members argued, with Carolina Wren, except perhaps the

coloration. However, the observer did not specify what plumage of House Sparrow the bird had a similar coloration to, leaving open the possibility of a richer, rustier brown characteristic of Carolina Wren.

Mountain Bluebird (Sialia currucoides)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, a female, was reported at Tipton, Lenawee Co., on 16 August 2008. The bird was described as about 7 inches in length, with the back and head a light to medium blue (about the shade of a Blue Jay [Cyanocitta cristata]), "the same blue color (as the color on the back and head) at the throat," unstreaked, off-white or cream underparts, dark beak, no distinctive eye ring, unmarked wings, and no streaking or spotting on the belly or underwings. The observer mentioned being unsure what the bird was at the time of the sighting, but becoming convinced of its identity at the suggestion of other birders on a listsery. Members nearly unanimously agreed that the description was inconsistent with any plumage of Mountain Bluebird. Females of this species have blue upperparts paler than that of Blue Jay, obvious white eye rings, white-edged wing covers (rather than plain wings), and whitish

throats lacking the blue tones of the upperparts. Further, males do not have off-white underparts.

Northern Parula (Parula americana)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Tawas City, losco Co., on 15 December 2007. The bird was described as "much smaller than chickadees and nuthatches," with a bright yellow breast that transitioned to a reddish-brown edge at the top, a white belly, no eye ring or eye stripe, blue-gray head and sides, prominent bars on wings, and a dark back, perhaps greenish. Members unanimously felt that although many of the field marks were suggestive, that the lack of eye arcs and the uniformly bluegray head and sides were incorrect for the species claimed. Several members mentioned the possibility that this description might better fit Tropical Parula (Parula pitiayumi) than Northern.

"Yellow" Palm Warbler (Dendroica palmarum hypochrysea)

Vote: 2-5, in the second round one description photographs

One second calendar year male was mist-netted and banded at Metro Beach Metropark, Macomb Co., on 13 May 2007. This record was first reviewed (and

accepted) in 2007 (Putnam 2008), but reconsidered here by majority vote of the committee following a request for reconsideration. The request was submitted due to the discovery that the observer mentioned in the original documentation that they couldn't be sure whether the bird may have been an intergrade "Western" Palm Warbler (D. p. palmarum) X "Yellow" Palm Warbler, All members agreed that this individual had more yellow on the underparts, more reddish-colored flank streaks, and a more extensive reddish cap than a typical "Western" Palm Warbler. However, most also felt that the yellow underparts were not as solidly yellow as typical adult "Yellow" Palm Warblers, the vent and belly having noticeable dull brownish patches admixed with the yellow. The reddish streaks on the flanks were also mentioned as thinner and less extensive than those of typical "Yellow" Palm Warblers by at least two members. The primary question was whether these traits could have been solely age-related (i.e. due to immaturity in a pure "Yellow" Palm Warbler) or whether they may have indicated intergradation of the two subspecies. The literature is not clear on how to distinguish these two possibilities, leading most members to reject.

Western Tanager (Piranga ludovicianus)

Vote: 0-7, for one of two individuals one description

Two individuals, a male and a presumed female, were reported at Marquette, Marquette Co., on 9 May 2008. The male was accepted (see above under "Records Accepted"), but the second individual was not. The second bird was described as "a duller bird" than the black-and-yellow male. Members unanimously shared the opinion that more description was necessary to rule out other species.

Spotted Towhee (Pipilo maculatus)Vote: 1-6

photographs

One individual was reported in Rose Twp., Oakland Co., on 7-12 April 2007. While one member felt satisfied with the photographic documentation, the remainder of the committee felt that a hybrid Spotted Towhee X Eastern Towhee (P. erythrophthalmus) could not be ruled out. The amount of white on the upperparts was thought to be perhaps too little for most Spotted Towhees, though clearly more than typical Eastern Towhees. More importantly, however, the amount of the white at the base of the primaries was thought to be either too great, or not adequately visible to be judged in the photos provided. This is a key trait for

separating pure Spotted Towhees, which lack or nearly lack any white here, from Spotted Towhee X Eastern Towhee hybrids which have considerable white here.

Spotted Towhee (Pipilo maculatus)

Vote: 3-4 one description photograph

One individual was reported at Copper Harbor, Keweenaw Co., on 2-15 November 2007. The only description provided mentioned that the bird had "white patches on its wings and back". The photograph clearly establishes the bird as a towhee, and all members freely acknowledged the need to establish the pattern of the bases of the outer primaries in eliminating a hybrid Spotted Towhee X Eastern Towhee, However, the committee was split on whether such a judgment was possible from the photo provided. At least four members felt it was not possible, while the minority felt the photo adequately established fully dark primary bases.

Spotted Towhee (Pipilo maculatus)

Vote: 0-7 one description photographs

One individual was reported at Chelsea, Washtenaw Co., on 3 November 2007. While

all members agreed that this individual was clearly either a Spotted Towhee or a Spotted Towhee X Eastern Towhee, most felt that the obvious white patch at the base of the primaries was too large for a pure Spotted Towhee. Sibley (2000) explains that some apparently pure Spotted Towhees can show limited white here, however specimen review by two members and field experience of others suggested that this individual's white was out of the range of variation for a pure Spotted Towhee. Several members also were given pause by the relatively small and limited spotting in the mantle and scapulars compared to typical Spotted Towhees.

Spotted Towhee (Pipilo maculatus)

Vote: 0-7 photographs

One individual was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 12 May 2008. The bird was described as having a "dark chocolate colored head with bright red eyes," rufous flanks, white belly, silver bill, and "back and wings with many white spotted [sic] and streakes [sic]." Members felt that a hybrid Spotted Towhee X Eastern Towhee could not be ruled out without a detailed description of the pattern of the bases of the primaries. At least one member

also argued that the bill of the not be ruled out. One member als species claimed should be black, not commented that an alternate male silver.

Bobolink (Dolichonyx orizyvorus)

Lark Sparrow (Chondestes grammacus)

Vote: 0-7, for one of two individuals one description

Two individuals were reported at Petersburg State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 6-22 May 2008, by one of several observers. The first individual was accepted (see above under "Records Accepted"). However, the second individual, claimed as "very likely a yearling," was never described.

Lark Bunting (Calamospiza melanocorys)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One individual, a male, was reported at Little Traverse Bay, Houghton Co., on 22 May 2007. The bird was described as "black overall with a broad long diagonal wingbar," with a heavy, conical bill, and body size being that of a blackbird "but chunkier." The committee was split on this record, many feeling that although the description was brief it could only fit a male Lark Bunting, with others arguing that without a description of the color of the wingbar, aberrant plumages of Brownheaded Cowbird (Molothrus ater), Red-winged Blackbird (Agelaius phoeniceus), or other species could

not be ruled out. One member also commented that an alternate male Bobolink (*Dolichonyx orizyvorus*) would fit the description if its white scapulars were confused with a wingbar.

Lark Bunting (Calamospiza melanocorys)

Vote: 2-5, in the second round one description photographs

One individual, a male, was reported at Bridgman, Berrien Co., on 4 June 2008. Members agreed that the photos, which were very underexposed and out-of-focus, did establish a black bird with a white patch of unknown shape and extent on the side of the bird's body. The description mentioned that the bird had a darker black head than body, as well as the peculiar observation that "one side of him appeared to have patches of his feathers removed, as if he had been pecked at." Several members were uncomfortable with the former field mark, as male Lark Buntings, they argued, should have equally black mantles and heads. The latter field mark was also taken as potentially the result of asymmetrical white patches on the left and right sides of the bird's body, which may be indicative of a leucistic individual of a commoner species such as Brown-headed Cowbird.

Nelson's Sparrow (Ammodramus nelsoni)

Vote: 2-5, in the second round one description photographs

One individual was reported at Muskegon State Game Area, Muskegon Co., on 26 May 2007. All members agreed that this individual was clearly either a Nelson's or a Saltmarsh Sparrow. There was, however, some disagreement about whether Saltmarsh could be fully ruled out. a concern validated in part by a possible specimen of this species from Michigan (Sibley 2005). Most members felt that vital field marks such as the extent and width of breast and flank streaking (Sibley 1996) and bill length and proportions could not be properly assessed due to the fact that they were obscured in the photographs and not fully enumerated in the written description. However, at least two members felt that the buffy throat only slightly paler than the malar, and the relatively crisp streaking and buffy background color on the hind flanks (the only part of the flanks visible in the photos) were a better fit for Nelson's.

Nelson's Sparrow (Ammodramus nelsoni)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Bay City Recreation Area, Bay Co., on 21 October 2007. A second hand correspondence was provided in which the author stated that another birder had relayed an observation in which a bird was heard to "sing" briefly, and that the observer felt it sounded like a Nelson's Sparrow. The committee unanimously agreed that secondhand reports are inadequate for acceptance, and that there was little actual description of the bird or its song. This record was subsequently reconsidered as Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow (see below under "Records Not Accepted").

Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow (Ammodramus nelsoni/caudacutus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual was reported at Bay City Recreation Area, Bay Co., on 21 October 2007. This record was initially rejected as Nelson's Sparrow (see above under "Records Not Accepted"). As in that case, the complete lack of a description and the second-hand nature of the report continued to be raised as concerns against acceptance.

McCown's Longspur (Calcarius mccownii)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, sex unclear, was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 12 May 2008. The bird was described as the size and shape of a House Sparrow, with a plain head, body, and face, with a "small blotch of dark on breast," a short tail with a hint of white "on the end," a sparrow-like bill, and overall appearance grayish-white. The committee felt that nothing in the description clearly identified the bird as a longspur, and that the report was in some ways inconsistent with the species claimed, or at least incomplete in its description. One member argued that House Sparrow was not eliminated by the description provided. Others argued that the tail of all McCown's Longspurs are tipped in black, not white, though the sides of a McCown's Longspur's tail would be white. Finally, the description of the face as plain puzzled at least one member who noted that the face of a male McCown's Longspur is contrastily patterned with gray, white, and black.

McCown's/Chestnut-collared Longspur (Calcarius mccownii/ ornatus)

Vote: 0-7 one description

One individual, sex unclear, was reported at Oscoda, losco Co., on 12 May 2008. This record was initially rejected as McCown's Longspur (see above

under "Records Not Accepted"), and was here given reconsideration as a broader grouping, per current MBRC practice. Members remained troubled by the tail description (white on "the end" of the tail), which was construed as incorrect for both species. Most also felt that the overall description (see McCown's Longspur account above) never clearly placed this bird in the longspur category, and that species such as House Sparrow and perhaps even American Tree Sparrow (Spizella arborea) could not be ruled out without more detail.

Smith's Longspur (Calcarius pictus)

Vote: 3-4 one description

One individual was reported at Point Iroquois, Chippewa Co., on 4 September 2007. The bird was described as brownish and streaked above, with buffy breast with indistinct brown streaks, dull white belly, lesser coverts bright white, greater coverts reddish-brown and tipped in white, very narrow eye ring, brownish tail with obvious white edges similar to those of Dark-eyed Junco (Junco hyemalis) in flight, and a short call described as a rattle similar to that of Lapland Longspur (Calcarius lapponicus). While many members felt the description was adequate for the species claimed, others were troubled by apparent inconsistencies in this

report. Specifically, the prominent white lesser coverts, a field mark favoring Smith's Longspur, make it likely that the bird was a male. This is the sex class with the most uniform buffy underparts (bill to vent), yet the bird was described as having a dull white belly and buffy breast; a contrast more typical of Lapland Longspur. Furthermore, the description of the greater coverts as reddish-brown was troubling to at least two members, as this is also more typical of Lapland Longspur (Smith's having relatively uniform brown greater coverts lacking rufous contrasts to the body at large). These inconsistencies led several members to the conclusion that a juvenile Lapland Longspur was not fully ruled out.

Pyrrhuloxia (Cardinalis sinuatus) Vote: 0-7, for two individuals one description

Two individuals were reported at Traverse City, Grand Traverse Co., on 3 August 2007. The birds were described as "much smaller in body than our local ... cardinals," with a yellow beak surrounded by red feathering, a crest "with some rusty coloring," some rusty red coloring on the breast and tail feathers, and a "squared off" tail. Although many members felt the description of plumage was consistent with the species claimed, most were troubled by the description of body size

as much smaller than Northern Cardinal (Cardinalis cardinalis). Pyrrhuloxia are similar in length to, though slightly less bulky than, a cardinal. At least one member also noted that the distinctive bill shape and color of Pyrrhuloxia are not described, a seemingly strange omission. These two inconsistencies left most members unable to accept this record.

Blue Grosbeak (Passerina caerulea)

Vote: 1-6, in the second round one description

One individual was reported at Ann Arbor, Washtenaw Co., on 24 May 2008. The bird was described as blue overall with distinct brown/tan on the wings, heavy bill, and size "somewhat larger than a House Sparrow." The song was described as "a melodic musical phrase, like a song sparrow in timbre but lower in pitch, with a strongly rhythmic feel: a-one-and-atwo-and-a-three-and-a, repeated at sedate intervals." Members felt that a second calendar year male Indigo Bunting (P. cyanea) was not ruled out by this description. They often retain patches of formative plumage (which is not blue) in the wing coverts through the prealternate molt (Pyle 1997), and are often mistaken as Blue Grosbeaks. The size comparison to House Sparrow would have helped separate the grosbeak from the bunting, but it was never made

explicitly clear that there was a direct size comparison. Finally, the song description, though suggestive to at least member, was deemed inconclusive by most.

Boat-tailed/Great-tailed Grackle (Quiscalus major/mexicanus)

Vote: 2-5 one description photographs

One male, initially rejected as Great-tailed Grackle (Putnam 2008), was reported at Oscoda, losco. Co., on 26 May-3 June 2007. The bird was described as 18 inches in length and all "black shinny [sic]" with a hint of being more so on the head and hind neck. Further, it had yellow eyes, a flat head, a black bill longer than the head, and a tail half longer than those of "the other grackles" standing nearby. Two members were satisfied that the bird couldn't be a Common Grackle (Quiscalus quiscula) based on size. However, most were concerned by the fact that the observer didn't specify which sex the accompanying Common Grackles were, and by the potential for error in the observer's method of estimating the bird's length. Specifically, the bird was said to stand in perfect side profile between two dandelions which the observer then measured at 18 inches apart. If the bird was actually shorter than 18 inches in length and standing next to female

Common Grackles, they argued, it could have been a male Common Grackle and fit the description.

Common Chaffinch (Fringilla coelebs)

Vote: 1-6 one description photographs

One female was reported at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 24 May 2008. The entire committee agreed with the identification, but most were troubled by the high likelihood that this individual resulted from a captive origin. There is evidence of a recent release of Eurasian fringillids, including this species, in the Chicago, Illinois, area in or around early 2004 (Chu 2005, Craves 2008). This record, the committee argued, was best considered a by-product of that or a similar release pending evidence of the natural occurrence of Common Chaffinch in Michigan.

Eurasian Tree Sparrow (Passer montanus)

Vote: 3-4 for one individual, 1-6 for two individuals video footage

Two individuals were reported at Cassopolis, Cass Co., on various dates between September and November 2006. These birds were videotaped at the exact location of a single

longstanding Eurasian Tree Sparrow, Michigan's first state record (Putnam 2007), and were suspected by the homeowner to possibly represent additional individuals. The committee reviewed the footage with the intent of determining whether to add any additional individuals to the record. The committee argued that the video actually shows one pure Eurasian Tree Sparrow and two odd individuals which appeared intermediate

between House Sparrow and Eurasian Tree Sparrow. Some felt the two intermediate individuals were certainly hybrids, and further review of the footage led to preparation of a manuscript detailing these birds' identities (Putnam, in prep.). Since one pure Eurasian Tree Sparrow had already been accepted for this site, and never were two pure birds clearly identifiable in the footage, the committee voted not to include any additional individuals in this record.

Acknowledgements

I thank Adam M. Byrne for editorial assistance with the manuscript.

References Cited

- Banks, R.C., R.T. Chesser, C. Cicero, J.L. Dunn, A.W. Kratter, I.J. Lovette, P.C. Rasmussen, J.V. Remsen, Jr., J.D. Rising, D.F. Stotz, and K. Winker. 2008. Forty-ninth Supplement to the American Ornithologists' Union Check-list of North American Birds. Auk 125(3):758-768.
- Byrne, A. 2001. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2000. Michigan Birds and Natural History 8:225-241.
- Byrne, A. 2004. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2002. Michigan Birds and Natural History 11(2):62-85.
- Chu, P.C. 1991. Actions of the MBRC for 1988 and 1989. *Jack-Pine Warbler* 68(5):19-24.
- Chu, P.C. 1992. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 1990 and 1991. *Jack-Pine Warbler* 69(5):17-23.
- Chu, P.C. 2005. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2004. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 12:184-206.
- Craves, J.A. 2008. Current status of European Goldfinch (Carduelis carduelis) in the western Great Lakes region. North American Birds 62(3): 498-501.

- Heindel, M.T. 1996. Field identification of the Solitary Vireo complex. *Birding* 28:458-471.
- Kaufman, K. 1994. Point/Counterpoint. Greenland White-fronted Geese Over Reported? Birding 26(6):380-382.
- Olsen, K. M., and & H. Larsson. 1997. Skuas & Jaegers. Yale University Press, New Haven.
- Olsen, K. M., and H. Larsson. 2003. Gulls of North America, Europe, and Asia. Princeton University Press, Princeton.
- Pittaway, R. 2009. Checklist of Recognizable Forms of Ontario Birds. http://www.ofo.ca/reportsandarticles/recognize.php, accessed 12 March 2009.
- Putnam, C.G. 2007. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2006. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 14(5):189-220.
- Putnam, C.G. 2008. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2007. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 15(5):201-248.
- Putnam, C.G. in preparation. Documentation of Eurasian Tree (Passer montanus) x House (P. domesticus) Sparrows in Cass County, Michigan.
- Pyle, P. 1997. Identification Guide to North American Birds, Part I. Slate Creek Press, Bolinas, CA.
- Pyle, P. 1998. Identification Guide to North American Birds, Part II. Slate Creek Press, Point Reyes Station, CA.
- Romagosa, C.M., and T. McEneaney. 1999. Eurasian Collared-Dove in North American and the Caribbean. *North American Birds* 53(4):348-353.
- Sibley, D. 1996. Field identification of the sharp-tailed sparrow complex. *Birding* 28:197-208.
- Sibley, D. 2000 The Sibley Guide to Birds. Alfred A. Knopf, New York, NY.
- Sibley, D.A. 2005. A possible specimen record of Saltmarsh Sharp-tailed Sparrow (*Ammodramus caudacutus*) from Michigan, with comments on the reliability of specimen data. *North American Birds* 53:524-525.