
Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2011

Philip Chu

*Department of Biology
St. John's University
Collegeville, MN 56321*

This is the 22nd report of the Michigan Bird Records Committee (MBRC). It covers the committee's actions during 2011.

In 2011 the MBRC consisted of regular members Adam Byrne (Clinton Co.), Philip Chu (Minnesota), Latham Claflin (Jackson Co.), James Dawe (Oscoda Co.), Louis Dombroski (Bay Co.), Skye Haas (Marquette Co.), and Scott Hickman (Alger Co.), and alternate members Brad Murphy (Oakland Co.) and David Slager (Ohio). Chu chaired the committee and Byrne was its secretary.

During 2011 the committee made 215 decisions on 175 records, with 119 (55.3%) of the decisions being to accept. The discrepancy between number of decisions and number of records, with there being 40 more decisions, is mainly consequent from records with multiple individuals; e.g., a single record of four Nelson's Sparrows (*Ammodramus nelsoni*) required four decisions, one for each of the four individuals claimed. Additionally, a number of birds were reviewed not once but twice: if not accepted as a member of the species claimed, then each was evaluated as a member of a more-inclusive species group. Thus, for example, a wading bird submitted as a Glossy Ibis (*Plegadis falcinellus*) but not accepted as such was then reviewed again as a *Plegadis* ibis.

For each record the following information is provided: a vote tally, an inventory of the documentation submitted, the number of birds claimed, and the dates and location reported. In addition, for accepted records only, observers who contributed documentation are listed, and the name of the person who first correctly identified the bird is listed and underlined, whether that person submitted documentation or not.



MBRC actions during 2011 resulted in the following changes to the Michigan bird list. First, two species, the Ross's Gull (*Rhodostethia rosea*) and the Lucy's Warbler (*Oreothlypis luciae*), were added to the list, bringing to 442 the number of species accepted for Michigan. Second, six species were upgraded in status – the Curlew Sandpiper (*Calidris ferruginea*), Prairie Falcon (*Falco mexicanus*), and Bullock's Oriole (*Icterus bullockii*) from Accidental to Casual, and the Black Vulture (*Coragyps atratus*), Scissor-tailed Flycatcher (*Tyrannus forficatus*), and Painted Bunting (*Passerina ciris*) from Casual to Regular; as per bylaw D.1, even though these last three species have moved to Regular status, they will remain on the committee's review list through 2014. And third, one species was downgraded in status – the Sage Thrasher (*Oreoscoptes montanus*), from Casual to Accidental.

Bylaw Changes

During 2011 the committee approved six changes to its bylaws. Two of those changes were minor – in essence, editorial in nature – whereas the remaining four were more important. Each of the latter is addressed below.

One important change concerned the length of committee membership. Previously bylaws B.3 and B.4 permitted regular members to serve two consecutive three-year terms, with a member's second term being contingent on a favorable vote from the rest of the committee. However, committee members who wish to continue serving had always received a favorable vote, raising a concern that the vote was merely a formality. Indeed, discussion revealed that a "no" vote would be difficult for some to cast, simply because of a desire to avoid hurt feelings. With the legitimacy of the second-term vote being therefore questioned, a proposal to eliminate it – and, so, the second term – was put forward, and the committee voted 9-0 to accept it. As a result, bylaws B.3 and B.4 were amended to indicate that regular members can no longer serve for two terms in a row.

A second important change concerned voting on records at meetings. Since its inception the MBRC has had a bylaw B.7 that states, "Specimens and some physical evidence will be considered at meetings;" however, each record voted on at a meeting gets just a few minutes of consideration, whereas records distributed by mail are available for committee members to evaluate for 30 days. Members agreed that limiting consideration of a record to several minutes is undesirable, so bylaw B.7 was deleted by a 9-0 vote; the result is that all records will now be distributed by mail, and will therefore be available for 30 days of evaluation.

A third significant change pertained to archiving. Previously bylaw C.4 stated, “The actions of the committee will be recorded and copies of the actions will be placed on file annually at the University of Michigan Museum of Zoology and the Kalamazoo Nature Center.” However, the committee’s actions are published annually, so why archive them? Given that a literal interpretation of C.4 is nonsensical, one committee member proposed that C.4 should instead pertain to archiving the minutes of committee meetings and the committee members’ vote rationales – items on which the bylaws had previously been silent; moreover, the proposal author suggested that the minutes and rationales should be housed with both the MBRC Chairperson and Secretary, so that the Chair and Secretary could determine the extent to which rationales would be made available.

This last point generated some discussion, because the committee had recently received several requests for vote rationales and had been unsure about how to proceed. To remedy this situation, the aforementioned proposal was modified to stipulate that vote rationales – with voter names redacted – would be made available to anyone.

After this modification, the proposal was that C.4 should state the following.

Vote rationales and meeting minutes will be recorded and copies of those documents will be kept by both the Chairperson and the Secretary. Final vote rationales, with voter names redacted, will be made available to anyone following a request to the Chairperson.

This proposal was accepted unanimously.

Finally, the fourth significant change concerned the submission of vote rationales. Since 2007 the MBRC has had a policy – obtained by consensus, but not stated in its bylaws – that committee members are to provide a rationale for every vote. However, there has been no penalty for failure to comply with the rationale policy, and certain members occasionally failed. To remedy this situation, a proposal was introduced to insert into bylaw E.4 both the policy and a penalty; the penalty proposed was to disqualify any rationale-less vote from a regular member and replace it with a rationale-bearing vote from an alternate member. The proposal passed by a 7-2 vote.



Records Accepted

Eurasian Wigeon (*Anas penelope*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Steven Kahl, David Peters

One male in basic plumage was at the Shiawassee National Wildlife Refuge, Saginaw Co., on 22 June 2011 (41st state record, 2nd county record).

Cinnamon Teal (*Anas cyanoptera*)

vote: 7-0

description: Skye Haas
 photofiles: Skye Haas, Demetri Lafkas, Gary Palmer

One male in basic plumage – found by Ryan Laforce – was in Gladstone, Delta Co., on 24 and 25 April 2011 (6th state record, 1st county record).

King Eider (*Somateria spectabilis*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Scott Hickman, Mark Hubinger

photofiles: Skye Haas, Max Henschell

One female was in Munising, Alger Co., from 11 to 19 December 2010 (55th state record, 1st county record).

King Eider (*Somateria spectabilis*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Philip Chu, James Fox, Tom Hince

photofiles: Adam Byrne, Allen Chartier, James Fox, Darlene

Friedman, Tom Hince, Brad Murphy
 One female – found by Kathi Cavanaugh and Hince – was in Algonac, St. Clair Co., from 18 December 2010 to 8 January 2011 (56th state record, 9th county record).

King Eider (*Somateria spectabilis*)

vote: 7-0

description: Adam Byrne
 photofiles: Adam Byrne

One was at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. on 23 April 2011 (57th state record, 5th county record). The bird's bill had a "subtle knob at its base" but appeared wholly black, and this, in conjunction with the wholly brownish plumage, suggests an adult female.

Barrow's Goldeneye (*Bucephala islandica*)

vote: 7-0

description: Caleb Putnam
 photofiles: Adam Byrne, Scott Jennex, Richard Naber, Caleb Putnam

One adult male in basic plumage – found by Curtis Dykstra and Putnam – was in Grand Rapids, Kent Co., from 10 to 15 March 2011 (12th state record, 1st county record).

Barrow's Goldeneye (*Bucephala islandica*)

vote: 7-0

description: Will Lewis
 photofile: Max Henschell

One adult male in basic plumage was in Chassell Twp., Houghton Co., on 30 March 2011 (13th state record, 1st county record).

Pacific Loon (*Gavia pacifica*)

vote: 7-0

description: Skyl Haas

One in basic plumage was at L'Anse Bay, Baraga Co., on 12 November 2010 (39th state record, 5th county record). The bird was believed to be second-cycle or older "due to the lack of obvious and complete pale edgings to the mantle feathers."

Pacific Loon (*Gavia pacifica*)

vote: 7-0

description: Craig Robson

photofiles: Craig Robson

One in juvenile or basic plumage – found by Heidi Doman and Robson – was in Marquette, Marquette Co., on 27 January 2011 (40th state record, 2nd county record).

Pacific Loon (*Gavia pacifica*)

vote: 7-0

description: Skyl Haas

photofiles: Skyl Haas

One wearing "near-complete" alternate plumage was found by Haas and Ryan Laforce at L'Anse Bay, Baraga Co., on 6 May 2011 (41st state record, 6th county record).

Western Grebe (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*)

vote: 5-2 in the second round

photofiles: Jack Kirby

One was on Black Lake in Cheboygan Co. from 20 to 29 October 2010 (30th state record, 1st county record).

Western Grebe (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Philip Chu, Matthew Hysell, Steve Sass, Alison Világ

photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Matthew Hysell

One was at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., from 25 November 2010 to 5 January 2011 (31st state record, 10th county record).

Western Grebe (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*)

vote: 7-0 for both individuals

descriptions: Skyl Haas, Charles Weaver

photofile: Max Henschell

Two were in Marquette, Marquette Co., from 18 to 25 December 2010 (32nd state record, 5th county record).

Western Grebe (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*)

vote: 7-0 for both individuals

descriptions: Philip Chu, David Slager



photofiles: Adam Byrne, Carol Cooper, Charlie DeWitt, Don Neumann, David Slager
Two – believed, on the basis of a conspicuous difference in bill size, to be a male and a female – were at Grand Haven, Ottawa Co., from 23 December 2010 to 9 January 2011 (33rd state record, 2nd county record).

Western Grebe (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*)

vote: 7-0
description: Skye Haas
One was in Marquette, Marquette Co., from 28 January to 11 February 2011 (34th state record, 6th county record).

Western Grebe (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*)

vote: 7-0
photofile: Patti Davidson
One was at Pentwater in Oceana Co. on 8 February 2011 (35th state record, 1st county record).

Magnificent Frigatebird (*Fregata magnificens*)

vote: 6-1
description: Sharon Klemm
photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Rick Brigham, Adam Byrne, Robert Epstein, Neil Gilbert, Josh Haas, Matthew Hysell, Sharon Klemm, Karl Overman, Caleb Putnam, Scott Terry

One adult male was at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., from 19 to 22 September 2010 (4th state record, 2nd county record).

***Fregata* species**

vote: 7-0
descriptions: Martin Blagdurn, Tom Hince, Linda Ruff
photofiles: Martin Blagdurn, Tom Hince, Anthony Jackson
One adult male was moving northeast along the shore of Lake St. Clair from Harrison Twp., Macomb Co., to Ira Twp., St. Clair Co., on 18 July 2010 (7th state record, 1st county record for Macomb and 2nd county record for St. Clair). The bird was initially submitted as a Magnificent Frigatebird, but under that more specific designation it was not accepted; see “Records Not Accepted” below.

Northern Gannet (*Morus bassanus*)

vote: 7-0
photofiles: Tim Baerwald
One first-cycle bird flew past St. Joseph in Berrien Co. on 28 November 2010 (12th state record, 1st county record).

White-faced Ibis (*Plegadis chihi*)

vote: 7-0 for both individuals
descriptions: Adam Byrne, Philip Chu, Brad Murphy, Will Weber
photofiles: Adam Byrne, Jerome Jourdan, Will Weber

One second-cycle White-faced Ibis at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., from 26 June to 23 July 2010 was joined by a first-cycle White-faced from 11 to 17 July (16th state record, 5th county record).

Also present from 26 June to 17 July was a third bird, this one also in its first cycle; it was documented by one observer as a Glossy Ibis but by others only as a member of the genus *Plegadis*. Because the lone identification to species was as a Glossy, the third bird was initially reviewed as such; in that review it was not accepted, but it was then re-reviewed under the more general designation of "*Plegadis ibis*" and accepted. See the first Glossy Ibis account under "Records Not Accepted" and the first accepted *Plegadis ibis* account below.

White-faced Ibis (*Plegadis chihi*)

vote: 7-0 for all six individuals

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Brad Murphy, Holly Vaughn

Six were found by Byrne, Murphy, Scott Terry, and Vaughn at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. on 8 May 2011 (17th state record, 6th county record). Byrne aged four of the six as adults; the other two were subadults, he thought, because they "averaged less iridescence"

in the upper secondary coverts and because the band of pale feathering that bordered their bare facial skin was buffier and "noticeably dirtier" than in the adults.

White-faced Ibis (*Plegadis chihi*)

vote: 6-1

photofiles: Bruce Delamarter, Phil Vreeman

One adult was found by Carolyn Weng at the Muskegon County Wastewater Management System, Muskegon Co., on 13 May 2011 (18th state record, 1st county record).

White-faced Ibis (*Plegadis chihi*)

vote: 7-0

description: Joseph Lipar

One adult was in Ludington, Mason Co., on 3 June 2011 (19th state record, 1st county record).

White-faced Ibis (*Plegadis chihi*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Philip Chu, Jerome Jourdan, Karl

Overman, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Jerome Jourdan, Brad Murphy, Karl Overman, Caleb Putnam, Scott Terry

One adult was at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. from 11 June to 29 July 2011 (20th state record, 7th county record).



Also present over the same date range was a second adult whose appearance was confusing; some thought it to be a second White-faced, whereas others declined to identify it to species. Because the second bird was identified as a White-faced in some of the documentation received, it was initially reviewed as *chihj*; not accepted as such, it was then reconsidered and accepted under the less restrictive designation of “*Plegadis ibis*.” See the White-faced Ibis account under “Records Not Accepted,” as well as the second *Plegadis ibis* account immediately below.

Plegadis ibis

vote: 7-0 in the second round

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Philip Chu, Brad Murphy, Will Weber

photofiles: Adam Byrne, Jerome Jourdan, Will Weber

One in its first cycle was at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. from 26 June to 17 July 2010 (23rd state record, 8th county record). (Also present during the same period were two White-faced Ibises, one from 26 June to 23 July and the other from 11 to 17 July; see the first accepted White-faced Ibis account above.)

The bird in question – initially reviewed as a Glossy Ibis and not accepted (see the first Glossy Ibis account under “Records Not Accepted” below) – had irises that were reddish brown and facial skin that was black-gray with pinkish white upper and lower borders. These traits suggested a mix of Glossy and White-faced alleles, as if the bird’s past included a hybridization event (Arterburn and Grzybowski 2003). However, MBRC members were not convinced that hybridization had occurred – there were questions about whether the observed characteristics could also be shown by a young White-faced with slowly developing bare-part colors.

Plegadis ibis

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Philip Chu, Jerome Jourdan, Karl Overman, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Jerome Jourdan, Brad Murphy, Karl Overman, Caleb Putnam, Scott Terry

Two adult ibises were at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., from 11 June to 29 July 2011. One of the two was accepted as a White-faced Ibis, but the other was not; see the fifth White-faced Ibis account above, as well as the single White-faced account under “Records Not Accepted” below.



Because the second ibis was not accepted as a White-faced, it was reviewed again, this time as a *Plegadis* ibis, and under that more inclusive designation it was accepted (24th state record, 9th county record).

The bird in question had darker red eyes and duller facial skin than its White-faced companion, leading some to speculate that it was a White-faced x Glossy hybrid (a combination described by Arterburn and Grzybowski 2003). The MBRC was not certain, however, wondering if some combination of individual variation and temporally fluctuating hormone levels could produce the observed characteristics.

Plegadis ibis

vote: 7-0

description: Lyle Hamilton, Daniel Hansz

One of uncertain age was at the Shiawassee National Wildlife Refuge in Saginaw Co. from 11 to 13 August 2011 (25th state record, 2nd county record). The bird was originally reviewed as a Glossy Ibis, but was not accepted as such; for more, see the second Glossy Ibis account under “Records Not Accepted” below.

Black Vulture (*Coragyps atratus*)

vote: 6-1

description: Timothy Hill

One was observed in Bertrand Twp., Berrien Co., on 23 July 2011 (23rd state record, 3rd county record).

Swallow-tailed Kite (*Elanoides forficatus*)

vote: 7-0

description: William Rapai

One was in Higgins Twp., Roscommon Co., on 4 August 2011 (8th state record, 1st county record).

Mississippi Kite (*Ictinia mississippiensis*)

vote: 7-0

description: Louis Dombroski

One adult was in the company of about 10 Broad-winged Hawks (*Buteo platypterus*) in Port Austin Twp., Huron Co., on 31 May 2011 (27th state record, 1st county record).

Mississippi Kite (*Ictinia mississippiensis*)

vote: 7-0

description: Latham Clafin

One – found by Clafin and Jacco Gelderloos – was in Whitefish Twp., Chippewa Co., on 4 and 5 June 2011 (28th state record, 11th county record).



“Krider’s” Red-tailed Hawk (*Buteo jamaicensis borealis* white phase

[Taverner 1936])

vote: 7-0

description: Matthew Hysell

photofiles: Matthew Hysell

One in its first cycle was found by Tim Baerwald and Hysell in Warren Dunes State Park, Berrien Co., on 30 April 2011 (1st state record, 1st county record).

Ferruginous Hawk (*Buteo regalis*)

vote: 7-0

description: Monica Essenmacher

One pale individual, by its plumage second-cycle or older, was at Port Crescent State Park in Huron Co. on 12 May 2011 (8th state record, 2nd county record).

King Rail (*Rallus elegans*)

vote: 7-0 for one juvenile, 6-1 for a second juvenile, and 6-1 for an adult

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Philip Chu, Jerome Jourdan, Jonathan Lautenbach, Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Catherine Carroll, Robert Epstein, Jerome Jourdan, Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam, Scott Terry

audiofiles: Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam

Four were at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. from 6 May through 3 September 2010 (130th state record, 35th county record). One of these was

accepted in 2010 (Putnam 2011), whereas the other three were accepted in 2011.

From May through mid-August, observers heard or saw just one adult King Rail at a time, but on 21 August one flightless juvenile was found, and on 28 August two juveniles were in view simultaneously.

With well-documented observations of one adult and two juveniles, the acceptance of three individuals was assured; acceptance of a second adult was less straightforward, however. No observer reported two adults, and that fact led to the initial rejection of adult #2 (see below under “Records Not Accepted”). The second adult was later reconsidered and accepted, however, as reservations about a second adult were overcome by the basics of sexual reproduction: if Pte. Mouillee held flightless young, then it must also have held two parents.

King Rail (*Rallus elegans*)

vote: 6-1

description: Millie Basden-Thomas

photofiles: Millie Basden-Thomas

One was found by Basden-Thomas, Adrian Binns, and Peter Thomas at the Nayanquing Point Wildlife Area in Bay Co. on 19 May 2011 (131st state record, 8th or 9th county record).

Long-billed Curlew (*Numenius americanus*)

vote: 6-1

description: written jointly by Ilse Gebhard and Russell Schipper One at Grand Mere State Park, Berrien Co., on 4 July 1990 was not accepted by the 1990 iteration of the MBRC (Chu 1992); subsequently, however, two committee members told Schipper that the rationales for negative votes were questionable, and that therefore the record might merit reconsideration. Accordingly, Schipper asked the current iteration of the MBRC if it would reevaluate the record in question.

The current committee examined the materials from 1990 and concluded that the arguments against acceptance were indeed flawed. One argument was that the bird in question had been part of a flock that included 18 Willets and four Marbled Godwits, and that such a flock was unlikely, but both of those species can occur in large numbers; for example, 29 Willets were recorded in Berrien Co. on 6 July 2010 (Dombrowski 2011) and nine Marbled Godwits were observed there on 12 July 2005 (Byrne 2006). A second argument was that the observers had no optical aids, but in the present case the observation period lasted for up to 20 minutes and involved distances down to 15-20 yards. As for the third

argument against acceptance, it was that the documentation was not detailed enough for a first state record – at the time Michigan had no accepted Long-billed Curlews; however, current MBRC bylaws do not require first records to meet a higher standard than other records. Because the previous votes against acceptance failed to withstand scrutiny, the current MBRC agreed to reexamine the record in question – and when the record was reexamined it was accepted.

This record predates Michigan's only other accepted record (Putnam 2011) by 20 years, so with its acceptance it becomes the state's (and county's) first.

Western Sandpiper (*Calidris mauri*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Adam Byrne, Brad Murphy, David Pavlik

One wearing alternate plumage was at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. on 29 April 2011 (211th state record, 61st or 62nd county record).

Western Sandpiper (*Calidris mauri*)

vote: 7-0

description: Latham Clafin

photofiles: Don Henise

One juvenile was found by Clafin, Henise, Mickey Kress, and Mike Sefton at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 17 August 2011 (212th state record, 62nd or 63rd county record).



Baird's Sandpiper (*Calidris bairdii*)

vote: 5-2 in the second round

description: Matthew Hysell

One was found by Andre Moncrieff in Oronoko Twp., Berrien Co., on 7 May 2010 (11th accepted spring record since 1993).

Baird's Sandpiper (*Calidris bairdii*)

vote: 6-1

photofiles: Alice Van Zoeren

One was at Platte River Point in Benzie Co. on 18 May 2010 (12th accepted spring record since 1993).

Baird's Sandpiper (*Calidris bairdii*)

vote: 7-0

description: Joseph Kaplan

One was at Portage Point, Delta Co., on 5 June 2011 (13th accepted spring record since 1993).

Curlew Sandpiper (*Calidris ferruginea*)

vote: 6-1

description: David Peters

One wearing alternate plumage was at the Shiawassee National Wildlife Refuge, Saginaw Co., on 24 May 2011 (14th state record, 2nd county record).

Ruff (*Philomachus pugnax*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Jerome Jourdan

One female wearing alternate plumage was found by Andy Dettling at the Pte. Mouillee State

Game Area, Monroe Co., on 2 June 2011 (51st state record, 23rd county record).

Red Phalarope (*Phalaropus fulicarius*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Matthew Hysell

Tim Baerwald and Hysell found two phalaropes – both wearing a mix of juvenal and formative feathers – offshore of St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 5 October 2011 (87th state record, 19th county record). One of the two was accepted as a Red in 2011; the other received an inconclusive vote and, as per MBRC bylaw E.1, will be resubmitted for a second round of voting.

Black-headed Gull

(*Chroicocephalus ridibundus*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Matthew Hysell, Warren Whaley

One basic-plumaged adult, found by the three above observers and Rhoda Johnson, was at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 14 November 2011 (13th state record, 2nd county record).

Ross's Gull (*Rhodostethia rosea*)

vote: 7-0 for both individuals

descriptions: Louis Dombroski, Skye Haas, Scott Hickman, Joanne Hubinger, Joseph Kaplan, Gilbert Lewis, Will Lewis, J. D. Phillips

photofiles: Skye Haas, David Pavlik, J. D. Phillips

Two adults in basic plumage, found by [Jeff Francois](#), [Lewis](#), and [Joseph Youngman](#), were at L'Anse Bay, Baraga Co., on 14 December 2010 (1st state record, 1st county record).

Mew Gull (*Larus canus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Latham Claflin, James Dawe, Louis Dombroski, James Fox
photofiles: Adam Byrne, Robert

Epstein, Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam, Joe Soehnel, Scott Terry
One adult wearing alternate plumage – found by [Ellen Peterson](#), [Glenn Peterson](#), [Marilyn Willard](#), and [Myles Willard](#) – was in Bangor Twp., Bay Co., from 10 to 19 May 2011 (sixth state record, 1st county record).

California Gull (*Larus californicus*)

vote: 7-0

description: Caleb Putnam
photofiles: [Tim Baerwald](#), Matthew Hysell, Caleb Putnam

One second-cycle individual was at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 23 and 24 May 2011 (20th state record, 12th county record).

Arctic Tern (*Sterna paradisaea*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: [Tim Baerwald](#), Matthew Hysell

One juvenile was at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., from 31 October to 15 November 2011 (20th state record, sixth county record).

Pomarine Jaeger (*Stercorarius pomarinus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: [Adam Byrne](#), [Brad Murphy](#)

One believed to be in its first cycle was found by [Byrne](#), [Blake Mann](#), [Murphy](#), and [Jim Pawlicki](#) at Port Huron, St. Clair Co., on 3 October 2010 (29th state record, 7th county record).

Band-tailed Pigeon (*Patagioenas fasciata*)

vote: 5-2 in the second round

description: [Robert Squire](#)
One was in Saugatuck Twp., Allegan Co., from 30 September to 3 October 2010 (2nd state record, 1st county record).

Eurasian Collared-Dove (*Streptopelia decaocto*)

vote: 7-0

description: [Joseph Kaplan](#)
photofiles: [Joseph Kaplan](#)
One was in Escanaba, Delta Co., from 7 June 2011 to an unspecified date in February 2012 (8th state record, 1st county record).

White-winged Dove (*Zenaida asiatica*)

vote: 7-0

description: [James Buschmann](#)
photofile: [James Buschmann](#)
One was in Dexter, Washtenaw Co., from 7 to 9 May 2011 (16th state record, 1st county record).



White-winged Dove (*Zenaida asiatica*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Robert Arthurs, Philip Chu

photofiles: Robert Arthurs, Louis Dombroski, Mark Hubinger, Skye Haas

One – found by Chu, Joanne Hubinger, Mark Hubinger, Donald Jennette, LaRue Wells, and Thomas Wheeker – was at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 29 and 30 May 2011 (17th state record, 5th county record).

Common Ground-Dove (*Columbina passerina*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Philip Chu, Caleb Putnam, Hank Veldman

photofiles: Jason Bojczyk, Rick Brigham, Skye Haas, Max Henschell, Tom Pavlik, Caleb Putnam, Scott Schuette, Rick Veldman

One male was at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., from 20 to 23 October 2010 (4th state record, 3rd county record).

Common Ground-Dove (*Columbina passerina*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Allen Chartier, Latham Clafin, James Dawe, Don Henise, James VanAllen

photofiles: Wendy Baker, Bob Bell, Don Henise, Doug Jackson, Brian McGee, Gary Nelkie, James VanAllen

One female, found by Baker and Janeq Little, was at Tawas Point State Park, Iosco Co., from 30 October to 20 November 2010 (5th state record, 1st county record).

Chuck-will's-widow (*Antrostomus carolinensis*)

vote: 7-0

audiofile: Rhoda Johnson

One – initially reported by Johnson and Jonathan Wuepper – was in Berrien Twp., Berrien Co., from 6 May to 1 July 2011 (11th state record, 7th county record). 2011 is the seventh consecutive year for Chuck-will's-widow at this location.

Chuck-will's-widow (*Antrostomus carolinensis*)

vote: 7-0

description: Craig Robson

audiofile: Craig Robson

One was in Norvel Twp., Jackson Co., from 11 May to 7 August 2011 (12th state record, 1st county record).

Chuck-will's-widow (*Antrostomus carolinensis*)

vote: 6-1

photofile: Brian Hicks

One was in Madison Heights, Oakland Co., on 15 May 2011 (13th state record, 1st county record).

Green Violetear (*Colibri thalassinus*)

vote: 7-0

description: Scott Hickman

photofiles: Stan Druckenmiller, Scot Stewart

One adult – found by Hickman and Debra Laurie – was in Onota Twp., Alger Co., on 2 and 3 July 2011 (6th state record, 2nd county record).

Green Violetear (*Colibri thalassinus*)

vote: 7-0

description: Mary Lou Tanton

photofiles: Roger Ferguson

One adult was in Springvale Twp., Emmet Co., on 13 and 14 July 2011 (7th state record, 1st county record).

Anna's Hummingbird (*Calypte anna*)

vote: 7-0 for both individuals

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Allen Chartier, Philip Chu, Latham Claflin, Scott Hickman, J. D. Phillips, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Jason Bojczyk, Rick Brigham, Adam Byrne, Allen Chartier, John Dettwiler, Robert Epstein, Darlene Friedman, Skye Haas, Jeremy Halka, Max Henschell, Mark Hubinger, Scott Jennex, Beth Olson, David Pavlik, J. D. Phillips, Caleb Putnam, Alan Ryff, Scott Stewart, Scott Terry, Kirk Zufelt

Two – an adult male and an adult female – were found by Sharon Cashin and Pat Grasser at Grand Marais, Alger Co., in early October 2010; the male was last seen on 11 November of that year, whereas the female remained through 18 December (1st state record, 1st county record).

Rufous Hummingbird (*Selasphorus rufus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Brian Allen, Allen Chartier

photofiles: Greg Bodker, Allen Chartier, Carl Freeman, Jeremy Halka, Linda Scribner

One first-cycle female was found by Kris Perry and Michael Perry in Eden Twp., Lake Co.; the bird was present from early August to 13 December 2010 (27th state record, 1st county record).

Rufous Hummingbird (*Selasphorus rufus*)

vote: 6-1

photofiles: Barney Twigg

One first-cycle male was in Augusta Twp., Washtenaw Co., from 2 to 8 November 2011 (28th state record, 1st county record).

Prairie Falcon (*Falco mexicanus*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Dan Duso

One was in Hampton Twp., Bay Co., on 3 November 2007 (3rd state record, 1st county record).



Prairie Falcon (*Falco mexicanus*)

vote: 7-0

description: [Christopher Lipps](#)

photofiles: [Christopher Lipps](#)

One was at Ludington State Park in Mason Co. on 14 August 2011 (5th state record, 1st county record).

Vermilion Flycatcher (*Pyrocephalus rubinus*)

vote: 7-0

description: [Florence Hawarden](#)

photofiles: [Florence Hawarden](#)

One adult male, found by [Hawarden](#) and [John Hawarden](#), was in the Porcupine Mountains Wilderness State Park, Gogebic Co. on 24 July 2011 (4th state record, 1st county record).

Ash-throated Flycatcher (*Myiarchus cinerascens*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Latham Clafin, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Don Chalfant, Latham Clafin, Robert Epstein, Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam, Scott Schuette, Mike Sefton, Scott Terry

One – found by [Barb Erickson](#) – was in Whitefish Twp., Chippewa Co., from early November 2010 to the 19th of that month (5th state record, 3rd county record).

Scissor-tailed Flycatcher (*Tyrannus forficatus*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Max Henschell, J. D. Phillips

One – found by [Karen Karl](#) – was in Copper Harbor, Keweenaw Co., from 12 to 16 May 2011 (36th state record, 5th county record).

Scissor-tailed Flycatcher (*Tyrannus forficatus*)

vote: 7-0

photofile: [Mark Armstrong](#)

One was present on 15 May 2011 along the border between Soo and Bruce Twps., Chippewa Co. (37th state record, 16th county record).

Scissor-tailed Flycatcher (*Tyrannus forficatus*)

vote: 6-1

description: [Mike Stake](#)

photofile: [Mike Stake](#)

One was at Tawas Point State Park in Iosco Co. on 24 May 2011 (38th state record, 2nd county record).

Scissor-tailed Flycatcher (*Tyrannus forficatus*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Bill Deephouse

One, found by [Bill Degowski](#) and [Bonnie Degowski](#), was in Eagle Harbor, Keweenaw Co., on 5 June 2011 (39th state record, 6th county record).

Loggerhead Shrike (*Lanius ludovicianus*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: [Demetri Lafkas](#)

One was at Portage Point, Delta Co., on 11 May 2011 (138th state record, 4th county record).

Loggerhead Shrike (*Lanius ludovicianus*)

vote: 7-0

photofile: J. D. Phillips

One in its first cycle was in Marquette, Marquette Co., on 11 June 2011 (139th state record, 1st county record).

Fish Crow (*Corvus ossifragus*)

vote: 5-2 in the second round

descriptions: Rick Brigham, Kenneth Brock, Brad Bumgardner, Adam Byrne, Allen Chartier, Philip Chu, Latham Claflin, James Dawe, Louis Dombroski, Skye Haas, Matthew Hysell, Joseph Lautenbach, Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam, Alison Világ, Phil Vreeman

photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Warren Whaley

audiofiles: Brad Bumgardner, Allen Chartier, Latham Claflin, Matthew Hysell, Caleb Putnam

Four – the first of which was discovered by Baerwald, Craig Bateman, and Hysell – were in Three Oaks Twp., Berrien Co., from 16 May to 28 October 2009 (1st state record, 1st county record).

Three of the 2009 Fish Crows were accepted in 2010 (Putnam 2011), but during the initial review one observer’s audiofiles were inadvertently excluded. That observer claimed a minimum of five individuals – two more than had previously been accepted. Therefore, in 2011 the 2009 Fish Crow record was reconsidered, this

time with the previously excluded audio evidence among the review materials; the committee was asked to decide if the additional audiofiles supported the presence of one or two additional birds. In the 2011 review one additional Fish Crow was accepted, raising the total number of accepted 2009 Fish Crows from three to four; however, a possible fifth bird was not accepted – a testament to the difficulty of using audio evidence to document more than a few individuals (see the first Fish Crow entry under “Records Not Accepted”).

Fish Crow (*Corvus ossifragus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Brad Bumgardner, Adam Byrne, Kip Miller, Alison Világ

photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Matthew Hysell

One was in Three Oaks Twp., Berrien Co., from 8 April to 27 November 2010 (2nd state record, 2nd county record); a second bird was reported by multiple observers but not accepted. For a brief discussion of the latter, see the second Fish Crow entry under “Records Not Accepted.”

Fish Crow (*Corvus ossifragus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Robert Arthurs, Craig Bateman



One, found by Tim Baerwald, was in Three Oaks Twp., Berrien Co., from 9 April 2011 through at least 6 July 2012 (3rd state record, 3rd county record); as in 2010, a second bird was reported but not accepted. The latter is briefly discussed in the fourth Fish Crow entry under “Records Not Accepted.”

Cave Swallow (*Petrochelidon fulva*)

vote: 7-0 in the second round

photofiles: Scott Schuette

One was at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 27 October 2010 (9th state record, 3rd county record).

Cave Swallow (*Petrochelidon fulva*)

vote: 7-0

description: Matthew Hysell

photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Matthew Hysell

One flew by St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 27 October 2010 (10th state record, 1st county record); it accompanied a second swallow that was also reported as a Cave, but the latter individual was not accepted. See the second Cave Swallow account under “Records Not Accepted” below.

White Wagtail (*Motacilla alba*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Jeff Buecking, Zachary DeBruine, James Fox, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Dane Adams, Tim Baerwald, Adam Byrne, James Fox, Don Henise, Jerome Jourdan, Brad Murphy, J. D. Phillips, Paul Poronto, Caleb Putnam, Mark Wloch

One was at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. from 9 to 25 April 2011 (3rd state record, 1st county record). During its stay the bird was undergoing prealternate molt, with new black feathers appearing on its throat and new greater upper secondary-coverts and rectrices growing in. This individual can be assigned to the subspecies *ocularis* on the basis of the dark line through its eye, the dark bar at the bases of its secondaries, and its pale tertial-margins, which were narrower on the longest tertial and broader on the other two; see Alström and Mild (2003).

Smith’s Longspur (*Calcarius pictus*)

vote: 7-0

photofiles: Scott Schuette, Kirk Zufelt

One was at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 9 and 10 September 2011 (19th state record, 10th county record).

Lucy’s Warbler (*Oreothlypis luciae*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Brad Murphy

photofiles: Karl Overman

One male, found by the above observers and Kenneth Mettie, Jr., was at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 12 November 2011 (1st state record, 1st county record); see Byrne (2012) for a first-hand account of the bird's discovery. This is only the second record for Lucy's Warbler east of the Mississippi River, with the first being from Massachusetts on 1 December 1979 (Heil 1981).

“Audubon’s” Yellow-rumped Warbler (*Setophaga coronata auduboni*)

vote: 6-1

description: James Fox

photofiles: Robert Epstein, James Fox, Jeremy Miller, Brad Murphy, Karl Overman

One male wearing alternate plumage – found by Sue Rolf – was at Kensington Metropark, Livingston Co., from 12 to 16 April 2011 (6th state record, 1st county record).

“Audubon’s” Yellow-rumped Warbler (*Setophaga coronata auduboni*)

vote: 6-1

descriptions: James Fox, Steve Hoin

photofile: Karl Overman

One alternate-plumage male was at Tawas Point State Park, Iosco Co., from 24 to 29 April 2011 (7th state record, 1st county record).

Townsend’s Warbler (*Setophaga townsendi*)

vote: 7-0

description: Peter Burke

One male was in Kalamazoo, Kalamazoo Co., on 18 May 1996 (1st state record, 1st county record).

In 2011 the MBRC re-reviewed Michigan’s three Townsend’s Warbler records. The records were reviewed a second time because the original reviews had failed to consider the problem of birds with both Townsend’s and Hermit Warbler alleles – a problem whose magnitude became clear to the MBRC only after Rohwer and Wood (1998) described Townsend’s/Hermit hybrid zones.

Of the three Michigan Townsend’s Warbler records, only the present one – originally reviewed and accepted in 1997 (Reinoehl 1998) – clearly met the Rohwer and Wood (1998) criteria for a “pure” Townsend’s; thus, only this one was accepted. For a discussion of the other two records, see the two Townsend’s Warbler accounts below under “Records Not Accepted.”



Green-tailed Towhee (*Pipilo chlorurus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Allen Chartier, James Fox

photofiles: Adam Byrne, Allen Chartier, James Fox, Janet Hug, Paul Poronto

One, found by Kathy McDonald, was in Bloomfield, Oakland Co., from 27 January to 8 February 2011; to universal surprise, it reappeared on 11 March (10th state record, 2nd county record).

Spotted Towhee (*Pipilo maculatus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Latham Claflin, Caleb Putnam, Jack Reinoehl

photofiles: Jason Bojczyk, Adam Byrne, Latham Claflin, Darlene Friedman, Caleb Putnam, Scott Schuette, Scott Terry

One female was at Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., from 24 October to 1 November 2010 (7th state record, 1st county record).

Spotted Towhee (*Pipilo maculatus*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Rick Brigham, Barbara Quinlan

photofiles: Rick Brigham, Barbara Quinlan

One male in Park Twp., Ottawa Co., was present from 5 to 11 November 2010 (8th state record, 1st county record).

Spotted Towhee (*Pipilo maculatus*)

vote: 7-0

description: Beth Olson

photofiles: Beth Olson

One male was in Marquette, Marquette Co., on 12 October 2011 (9th state record, 1st county record).

Lark Sparrow (*Chondestes grammacus*)

vote: 7-0

description: Zachary Gayk

One was in Central, Keweenaw Co., on 16 August 2010 (101st state record, 12th county record).

Lark Sparrow (*Chondestes grammacus*)

vote: 7-0

photofile: Matti Hakkila

One was in Baraga, Baraga Co., on 6 May 2011 (102nd state record, 2nd county record).

Lark Sparrow (*Chondestes grammacus*)

vote: 7-0

photofile: Tim Baerwald

One was at St. Joseph in Berrien Co. on 11 May 2011 (103rd state record, 10th county record).

Black-throated Sparrow (*Amphispiza bilineata*)

vote: 7-0

description: Chip Francke

One adult was in Ferrysburg, Ottawa Co., on 12 September 2011 (4th state record, 1st county record).

Nelson's Sparrow (*Ammodramus nelsoni*)

vote: 7-0 for two individuals and 6-1 for a third

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Matthew Hysell, Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Matthew Hysell, Caleb Putnam, Scott Terry
Three were in Royalton Twp., Berrien Co., on 9 October 2010 (33rd state record, 3rd county record).

In fact, the number of Nelson's Sparrows reported at this site on 9 October was four, but one of the four was not accepted as such, being instead accepted under the more general designation of "Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow." See the first Nelson's Sparrow entry under "Records Not Accepted," as well as the single Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow entry under "Record Accepted" below.

Nelson's Sparrow (*Ammodramus nelsoni*)

vote: 6-1

photofiles: Tim Baerwald

One was in Buffalo Twp., Berrien Co., on 30 May 2011 (35th state record, 4th county record).

Nelson's Sparrow (*Ammodramus nelsoni*)

vote: 6-1

description: David Pavlik

photofiles: Matthew Hysell, David Pavlik

One – found by Tim Baerwald and Hysell – was at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 21 and 22 September 2011 (36th state record, 5th county record).

Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow (*Ammodramus nelsoni/caudacutus*)

vote: 6-1

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Matthew Hysell, Brad Murphy, Caleb Putnam

photofiles: Tim Baerwald, Matthew Hysell, Caleb Putnam, Scott Terry
One was in Royalton Twp., Berrien Co., on 9 October 2010 (7th state record, 1st county record).

The present bird was one of four Nelson's Sparrows claimed in Royalton Twp. on 9 October; however, it was not accepted as a Nelson's. See the first Nelson's Sparrow account above, as well as the first Nelson's Sparrow account below under "Records Not Accepted."

Having not been accepted as a Nelson's Sparrow, the bird in question was reconsidered as a Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow, and accepted on the strength of its yellow-orange supercilium, yellow-orange flanks with dark streaking, and dark back with white streaks.

Golden-crowned Sparrow (*Zonotrichia atricapilla*)

vote: 7-0

descriptions: Allen Chartier, Latham Claffin, Jerome Jourdan, Caleb Putnam



photofiles: Adam Byrne, Allen Chartier, Latham Claflin, James Fox, Jerome Jourdan, William McHale, Caleb Putnam, Scott Terry
One adult was on Belle Isle, Wayne Co., from 2 to 4 November 2010 (5th state record, 1st county record).

Western Tanager (*Piranga ludoviciana*)

vote: 7-0
descriptions: Louis Dombroski, Skye Haas, Demetri Lafkas
photofile: Mike Berg
One adult male was in Gladstone, Delta Co., on 17 and 18 May 2011 (24th state record, 2nd county record).

Western Tanager (*Piranga ludoviciana*)

vote: 7-0
descriptions: Louis Dombroski, Skye Haas, Beth Olson
photofiles: Louis Dombroski, Skye Haas, Mark Hubinger, Beth Olson
One first-cycle male was at Peninsula Point, Delta Co., from 19 to 23 May 2011 (25th state record, 3rd county record).

Western Tanager (*Piranga ludoviciana*)

vote: 6-1
description: Steven Gasser
One male was at the Genesee Recreation Area in Genesee Co. on 23 August 2011 (26th state record, 1st county record).

Blue Grosbeak (*Passerina caerulea*)
vote: 7-0

descriptions: Adam Byrne, James Dawe, Caleb Putnam, Steve Sass, Jonathan Wuepper
photofiles: Jeremy Joswick, Mike Mahler, Caleb Putnam, Steve Sass
One adult male was in Pokagon Twp., Cass Co., from 16 June to 23 August 2011 (15th state record, 1st county record).

Blue Grosbeak (*Passerina caerulea*)
vote: 7-0

photofile: Tim Baerwald
One female or first-cycle male was in Decatur Twp., Van Buren Co., from 4 to 10 July 2011 (16th state record, 1st county record).

Painted Bunting (*Passerina ciris*)
vote: 6-1

description: David Peters
photofiles: David Peters
One female or first-cycle male was in Saginaw, Saginaw Co., from 24 to 27 April 1995 (4th state record, 1st county record).

Painted Bunting (*Passerina ciris*)
vote: 7-0

descriptions: Adam Byrne, Latham Claflin, James Dawe, James Fox
photofiles: Robert Epstein, Caleb Putnam, Joe Soehnel, Scott Terry
One adult male, found by Judy Ransom, was in Bangor Twp., Bay Co., from 9 to 12 May 2011 (22nd state record, 1st county record).

Bullock's Oriole (*Icterus bullockii*)

vote: 7-0 in the second round
 photofiles: Dale Leitzke
 One female was in Holmes Twp.,
 Menominee Co., from 1 to 12
 December 2010 (6th state record,
 1st county record).

Records Not Accepted

**Black-bellied Whistling-Duck
 (*Dendrocygna autumnalis*)**

vote: 3-4
 one description
 One was described from the Pte.
 Mouillee State Game Area in
 Monroe Co. on 28 August 2010.

Ross's Goose (*Chen rossii*)

vote: 1-6
 one description
 11 photofiles
 One was reported in Marquette,
 Marquette Co., from 17 to 30
 November 2010.

Eurasian Wigeon (*Anas penelope*)

vote: 0-7
 one description
 One was described in Sanilac Twp.,
 Sanilac Co., on 16 April 2006.

Mottled Duck (*Anas fulvigula*)

vote: 2-5
 two photofiles
 One was identified in Benton Twp.,
 Berrien Co., on an unspecified date
 in October 2010.
 The photofiles documenting that
 identification show a dark brownish
 duck with a gray-buff head, a

bright greenish yellow bill with a
 suggestion of a dark spot at the
 gape, and a bluish speculum; the
 speculum had two flecks of white
 on the leading edge and a very
 fine white line on the trailing edge.
 On the basis of these features, the
 identification received support from
 a minority of MBRC members; the
 majority, however, had reservations.

(1) In a Mottled Duck the
 body feathers (most notably those
 of the scapulars and flanks) have
 buff to tawny margins and internal
 markings – but in the present case
 the patterning of individual body
 feathers could not be determined
 because of the poor resolution of
 the photos.

(2) In a Mottled Duck the
 chin, throat, and foreneck are
 unstreaked, and indeed the
 foreneck was paler for the bird in
 question – but, because the photos
 are poorly resolved, reviewers
 could not determine if the foreneck
 appeared paler because it
 was unstreaked, because it was
 streaked less heavily, or simply
 because it was more strongly lit.

(3) In some Mottled Ducks
 there is an obvious black spot
 at the gape, and though photos
 of the bird in question are
 suggestive, the presence of a spot
 is not unambiguously clear. This is
 another issue that might have been
 settled with better-resolved photos.



(4) In a small sample of photos of flying Mottled Ducks, the males showed little or no dark mottling in the under primary-coverts; in contrast, the under primary-coverts of the Benton Twp. bird showed a heavy dark line, a condition shared with many American Black Ducks (*Anas rubripes*).

Cinnamon Teal (*Anas cyanoptera*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was claimed from the Munuscong Wildlife Management Area in Chippewa Co.; the claim dated to an unknown day in July 1993.

King Eider (*Somateria spectabilis*)

vote: 0-7

one description

In a brief report – from Mackinaw City, Emmet Co., on 20 November 2010 – the bird in question was described as being “brown overall” with a “light/whitish” breast, a “white spot not always visible” in the hip region, and a “yellow/orange” bill. Though these details are consistent with a young male King Eider, they are also consistent young males from some Common Eider populations, and, indeed, with some domestic Mallards. Moreover, because of its brevity the report includes no information about how long the bird was in view, its distance from the observer, the conditions of observation,

or any optical equipment. As one committee member wrote, “Without any of this information it is impossible to know if the details... could have been accurately assessed;” he continued, “What if the bird was 1 km out in heavy surf and fog?”

For all of the above reasons, the Emmet Co. bird was not accepted as a King Eider – and, having not been accepted as a King, it was re-reviewed as a King/Common. Information about the latter decision can be found in the account immediately following this one.

King/Common Eider (*Somateria spectabilis/mollissima*)

vote: 1-6

one description

As is mentioned above, an eider was reported from Mackinaw City, Emmet Co., on 20 November 2010. Originally reviewed as a King and not accepted, it was reviewed again as a King/Common; unfortunately, the factors that made it unacceptable as a King also made it unacceptable as a King/Common. See the King Eider account immediately preceding this one.

Barrow's Goldeneye (*Bucephala islandica*)

vote: 0-7

one description

This record – pertaining to a male in basic plumage in Marquette, Marquette Co., from 24 April to 6 May 1962 – was originally reviewed and accepted in 1994 (Chu 1996); however, it was reconsidered in 2011 because of a concern that the documentation did not eliminate a Barrow's Goldeneye x Common Goldeneye (*Bucephala clangula*) hybrid. Concern stemmed from the brevity of the supporting description, which indicates only a white crescent on the face, “black on the sides” that was “distinct,” and a “row of white spots along the black sides of the body.”

In fact, hybrids can combine all three of the listed features – see, e.g., Gochfeld and Tudor (1976) or Martin and DiLabio (1994) – and for this reason no member of the current MBRC was able to accept the record in question.

A more complete description would provide additional detail about the white facial crescent and the black on the sides. Specifically, in a “pure” Barrow's the white crescent should be more exaggerated, with its dorsal apex extending above the eye, and the black of the sides should form a short downward-pointed spur on the side of the chest.

Barrow's Goldeneye (*Bucephala islandica*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was reported from Manistee, Manistee Co., on 17 February 2011.

Western Grebe (*Aechmophorus occidentalis*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One, at Indian Lake in Cass Co. on 27-28 November 2010, was described as being “much larger than the horned, eared and pied-billed grebes that we see fairly frequently;” it had a “Dark head, neck, and body,” a “sharply contrasting white throat and breast,” and a “Long, sharp bill” that “appeared slightly uptilted.” In addition, the observer noted that the bill was “relatively dark” and that there was “dark around [the] eye.”

Regrettably, the above details – while appropriate for a Western Grebe – could also match a Common or Red-throated Loon, a fact that led MBRC members to vote against acceptance.

Aechmophorus grebe

vote: 0-7

one description

After not being accepted as a Western Grebe, the above bird – at Indian Lake in Cass Co. on 27-28 November 2010



– was reviewed again as an *Aechmophorus* grebe; however, it was not accepted as such because, as mentioned above, the documentation did not eliminate a loon from consideration.

Magnificent Frigatebird (*Fregata magnificens*)

vote: 1-6

three descriptions

10 photofiles

On 18 July 2010, an adult male frigatebird was observed moving northeast along the shore of Lake St. Clair from Harrison Twp., Macomb Co., to Ira Twp., St. Clair Co.

The frigatebird was identified as a Magnificent, rather than a Great, primarily because no alar bars were seen; however, the MBRC was less certain that a Great had been eliminated. Howell (1994) indicated that the Great's alar bars can be less obvious when the plumage is worn, particularly if views are less than ideal. Thus, to be sure about the absence of alar bars, one would need to be confident that reasonable views had been obtained – but the observers' written details are so brief that the adequacy of their views is impossible to assess. Moreover, their photographs do not resolve the viewing-condition issue, showing only low light and a frigatebird silhouette.

Another character mentioned was “pale or grayish feet,” and grayish feet would indeed indicate a Magnificent – but “pale” feet could be pinkish, and pinkish feet would indicate a Great.

Anhinga (*Anhinga anhinga*)

vote: 3-4

one description

One was reported from Ludington State Park in Mason Co. The report was submitted to eBird with the date of 29 July 2008, but, in response to follow-up questions from the state's eBird reviewer, the observer wrote, “I actually saw it in the State Park on several occasions, but I don't have the exact dates; all sightings took place in a three week period, however.”

Anhinga (*Anhinga anhinga*)

vote: 1-6

one description

two photofiles

One was reported over River Rouge, Wayne Co., on 8 May 2011.

Anhinga (*Anhinga anhinga*)

vote: 1-6

two descriptions

two photofiles

One was claimed over Ann Arbor, Washtenaw Co., on 21 May 2011.

Yellow-crowned Night-Heron
(*Nyctanassa violacea*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was described from the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., on 5 June 2011.

Glossy Ibis (*Plegadis falcinellus*)

vote: 0-7

four descriptions

36 photofiles

A first-cycle ibis documented as a Glossy was at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. from 26 June to 17 July 2010. (Also present during the same period were two White-faced Ibises, one from 26 June to 23 July and the other from 11 to 17 July; see the first White-faced Ibis account under "Records Accepted" above.)

The bird in question was identified as a Glossy because it had brownish irises and black-gray facial skin with whitish upper and lower borders; however, multiple observers reported, and photofiles showed, that the brown of the irises had a reddish tint, and that the white of the facial-skin borders was faintly pink-tinged – both of which are inconsistent with a Glossy Ibis of any age.

Though the bird was not acceptable as a Glossy, it was eventually accepted as a *Plegadis* ibis. See the first accepted *Plegadis* ibis account above.

Glossy Ibis (*Plegadis falcinellus*)

vote: 0-7

two descriptions

One of uncertain age was reported at the Shiawassee National Wildlife Refuge in Saginaw Co. from 11 to 13 August 2011.

Though identified by one of two observers as a Glossy, the ibis' iris color could not be determined, and the only description of its bare facial skin was that, "There were no patterns observable." For precisely these reasons the second observer declined to identify the bird to species, and the MBRC agreed with the latter's assessment. After not being accepted as a Glossy Ibis, the bird in question was re-reviewed, this time simply as a member of the genus *Plegadis*. See the third *Plegadis* ibis account under "Records Accepted" above.

White-faced Ibis (*Plegadis chihi*)

vote: 0-7

five descriptions

26 photofiles

Two adult ibises were at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area, Monroe Co., from 11 June to 29 July 2011. One of the two was universally believed to be a White-faced, and was accepted as such (see the fifth White-faced Ibis account under "Records Accepted" above). The other, however, was of less certain identity – some thought it was a White-faced, whereas



others wondered if it was a Glossy x White-faced hybrid.

The latter was White-faced-like because it had reddish irises and some pink in the facial skin; however, it differed from the accompanying White-faced in several ways. First, the red of its irises was darker. Second, its facial skin was duller – not pinkish red like that of its companion, but dark gray with a pinkish tinge and paler purple-pink upper and lower borders. And third, it lacked its companion's broad band of whitish feathering on the face, having instead just a few brown-white flecks among the supraloral feathers. The darker irises, especially, raised concerns that the bird might have Glossy Ibis alleles, and one could argue that those concerns were supported by the bird's duller facial skin.

Though the bird in question was not accepted as a White-faced, it was ultimately accepted as a *Plegadis* ibis. See the second *Plegadis* ibis account under "Records Accepted" above.

Black Vulture (*Coragyps atratus*)

vote: 2-5 (first review); 2-5 (second review)

one description

One was reported from Hayes Twp., Charlevoix Co., on 2 September 2010.

Initially the documentation for this record consisted of an e-mail from

the observer, and on the basis of that e-mail the record was not accepted.

Shortly after this initial decision – and purely by coincidence – the observer provided a more formal account of his sighting, and because that account provided some additional information the MBRC decided to review the record again. However, despite the additional information, the second review yielded the same negative result as the first.

In both cases, reviewers were concerned about two things. First, the bird was seen with the "naked eye" from a moving car – the observer was a passenger in the vehicle – and that fact led committee members to wonder about the reliability of the features that were described. And second, even if the description is taken at face value, it contains elements that were judged, by some, to be inappropriate for the species claimed: most importantly, size was described as being "no bigger than a [Common] Raven," but the mass of a Black Vulture is typically over one-and-a-half times that of a raven.

Black Vulture (*Coragyps atratus*)

vote: 1-6

one description

One was described from Harrison Twp., Macomb Co., on 28 June 2011.

Mississippi Kite (*Ictinia mississippiensis*)

vote: 3-4

one photofile

The single photofile was taken on 23 May 2011 in Huron Co., with the only additional locality information being “near Geiger Rd.”

White-tailed Eagle (*Haliaeetus albicilla*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was reported from Port Crescent State Park, Huron Co., on 21 May 2011.

“Krider’s” Red-tailed Hawk (*Buteo jamaicensis borealis* white phase [Taverner 1936])

vote: 1-6

one description

One was described from Port Austin Twp., Huron Co., on 1 April 2011.

Ferruginous Hawk (*Buteo regalis*)

vote: 2-5

one description

One was identified in Port Austin Twp., Huron Co., on 1 May 2011.

King Rail (*Rallus elegans*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was claimed from Four Mile Lake in Washtenaw Co. on 20 May 2003.

King Rail (*Rallus elegans*)

vote: 2-5 in the second round

six descriptions

33 photofiles

three audiofiles

Three King Rails, an adult and two flightless juveniles, were observed at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. from 6 May through 3 September 2010; the presence of one more individual – a second adult – was inferred but, initially, not accepted. The present entry refers to that initial negative decision.

For a more complete account of this record, see the first King Rail account under “Records Accepted” above. As that account indicates, the presence of a second adult was eventually reconsidered and accepted.

Eskimo Curlew (*Numenius borealis*)

vote: 0-7

one specimen

An adult Eskimo Curlew specimen at the Museum für Naturkunde in Berlin, ZMB 12406, bears a label handwritten by the famous German ornithologist Erwin Stresemann. That label gives the locality of collection as “Detroit, Michigan,” the collection date as “Herbst [= autumn] 1834,” and the collector as “Albert Koch.”

Unfortunately, the specimen also bears another, older, label, and this second label gives the locality as “Missouri,” provides no date, and



identifies the collector as “Koch S.” In an attempt to determine if the specimen in question came from Michigan or Missouri, the MBRC consulted Neumann and Mauersberger (1990). That publication is relevant because it discusses the North American collections of Albert Koch, identified by Stresemann as the collector of ZMB 12406. Unfortunately, though Neumann and Mauersberger do mention that specimen, and though they faithfully describe its two labels, they do not resolve the issue of which label is correct.

Western Sandpiper (*Calidris mauri*)

vote: 1-6
 one description
 One was described from Brownstown Twp., Wayne Co., on 14 September 2010.

Western Sandpiper (*Calidris mauri*)

vote: 0-7
 one description
 four photofiles
 One was reported from Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co. on 28 May 2011.

Baird's Sandpiper (*Calidris bairdii*)

vote: 0-7
 one description
 One was identified in Chippewa Twp., Isabella Co., on 16 May 2011.

Baird's Sandpiper (*Calidris bairdii*)

vote: 0-7 for both individuals
 one description
 Two were claimed from Indian Point, Delta Co., on 3 June 2011.

Baird's Sandpiper (*Calidris bairdii*)

vote: 0-7
 one description
 One was reported from the Muskegon County Wastewater Management System, Muskegon Co., on 5 June 2011.

Red Phalarope (*Phalaropus fulicarius*)

vote: 0-7
 one description
 One was described from the Muskegon County Wastewater Management System, Muskegon Co., on 17 October 2009.

Red Phalarope (*Phalaropus fulicarius*)

vote: 3-4 for all three individuals
 one description
 Three were identified at Sand Point, Baraga Co., on 28 and 29 November 2010.

Red Phalarope (*Phalaropus fulicarius*)

vote: 3-4 for both individuals
 two descriptions
 Two were claimed at Port Huron, St. Clair Co., on 1 October 2011.

Black-headed Gull

(*Chroicocephalus ridibundus*)

vote: 3-4

one description

One was reported in Erie Twp., Monroe Co., from 23 November to 6 December 1975.

Ross's Gull (*Rhodostethia rosea*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was claimed from Muskegon, Muskegon Co., on 18 January 2010.

Heermann's Gull (*Larus heermanni*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was claimed from Harrisville State Park in Alcona Co. on 28 September 2011.

California Gull (*Larus californicus*)

vote: 3-4 in the second round

one description

seven photofiles

One was documented in New Buffalo, Berrien Co., on 27 November 2010, and the documentation was strongly suggestive of the species claimed. In this regard important features were the bird's size ("slightly smaller" than adjacent Herring Gulls), bill color (yellow with red and black marks), leg color (yellow), iris color (dark), and mantle color ("slightly darker" than in the nearby Herrings).

Unfortunately, age of the bird in question was not clear: it was said to be an adult, but nothing in the documentation excluded an individual in its third cycle. If the bird was in its third cycle, then both the black mark on its bill and its dark irises could be due to immaturity.

Moreover, multiple committee members expressed concern about mantle color. Though the New Buffalo bird was said to be darker-mantled than the surrounding Herring Gulls, the difference was not observed in the field – the observer noticed it only when reviewing his photofiles. And as for those photos, they leave open the possibility that the darker appearance was an artifact of the bird's angle relative to its companions.

If the black mark on the bill and the dark irises could be due to immaturity, and if the darker mantle could be an artifact of angle, then that leaves only size and leg color, and a majority of the MBRC was reluctant to rely on those two characters alone to identify a California Gull.

Arctic Tern (*Sterna paradisaea*)

vote: 2-5 in the second round

one description

One was described from L'Anse Bay, Baraga Co., on 14 May 2010.



Arctic Tern (*Sterna paradisaea*)

vote: 0-7 for both individuals
one description
Two were claimed in Harrisville
State Park, Alcona Co., on 14 May
2011.

Pomarine Jaeger (*Stercorarius pomarinus*)

vote: 1-6
one description
three photofiles
One was reported at St. Joseph,
Berrien Co., on 29 October 2011.

alcid species

vote: 1-6 in the second round
one description
The observer reported finding an
Ancient Murrelet carcass at Holland
State Park, Ottawa Co., on 7 July
1965; however, because his report
was written from memory in 2010,
45 years after the fact, committee
members were hesitant to accept
it. Thus in 2010 it was reviewed
and not accepted twice, first as
an Ancient Murrelet and then as a
murrelet species (Putnam 2011),
and in 2011 it was reviewed and
not accepted as an alcid species.

**Eurasian Collared-Dove
(*Streptopelia decaocto*)**

vote: 0-7
one description
One was described in Three Oaks,
Berrien Co., on 5 June 2011.

White-winged Dove (*Zenaida asiatica*)

vote: 2-5
one description
One was reported at Lake Erie
Metropark, Wayne Co., from 14 to
25 September 2010.

White-winged Dove (*Zenaida asiatica*)

vote: 1-6
one description
One was identified in Harrisville,
Alcona Co., from 4 to 14 May
2011.

Groove-billed Ani (*Crotophaga sulcirostris*)

vote: 0-7 in the second round
one description
two photographs
This bird, from Berrien Springs,
Berrien Co., on 3-11 November
1968, was initially reviewed in
1994, at which time it received
an inconclusive vote – neither
positive enough for outright
acceptance nor negative enough
for outright rejection. Those who
voted to accept did so because
the description stated, “Grooves
[in the bill were] seen by several
observers.” Dissenters argued that
the author of the description did
not see grooves himself, and that
therefore the existence of grooves
was only second-hand information;
that grooves were not visible in
the photographs; that Smooth-
billed Ani specimens (e.g., UMMZ

125501) can show some weak wrinkles in the rhamphotheca; and that the photographed bill shape can be matched by both Groove-billed Anis and some Smooth-billed.

Given the inconclusive initial vote, committee bylaws specify that the record should have been resubmitted for a second vote as a Groove-billed Ani. However, instead of being resubmitted as a Groove-billed, the record was resubmitted as an “ani species” (Reinoehl 1999), and under that less restrictive designation it was accepted.

To correct this oversight, the current iteration of the MBRC held a second vote on the Groove-billed Ani record, and this time members voted decisively against accepting the bird as a Groove-billed.

Rufous/Allen’s Hummingbird (*Selasphorus rufus/sasin*)

vote: 0-7

one description

On 10 July 2010, an article was published that mentioned the presence of a Rufous Hummingbird on Mackinac Island (Mackinac Co.) “Earlier this summer,” and though the article contains a fine summary of the appearance, physiology, and behavior of *S. rufus*, it contains no information specific to the Mackinac Island individual. Because the article contained no information about the Mackinac

Island bird, committee members could not support the record in question. Thus, in 2010 the bird was judged to be unacceptable as a Rufous Hummingbird (Putnam 2011), and in 2011 it was again judged to be unacceptable – first as a Rufous/Allen’s Hummingbird and then as a member of the genus *Selasphorus* (see the *Selasphorus* species account immediately below).

***Selasphorus* species**

vote: 0-7

one description

As is mentioned above, a Rufous Hummingbird was reported from Mackinac Island, Mackinac Co., in the summer of 2010; however, the record was found unacceptable three times – first as a Rufous Hummingbird, then as a Rufous/Allen’s Hummingbird, and finally, here, as a *Selasphorus* hummingbird.

Golden-fronted Woodpecker (*Melanerpes aurifrons*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was described in Waucedah Twp., Dickinson Co., on 4 March 2011.



Ivory-billed Woodpecker
(*Campephilus principalis*)

vote: 0-7

four photofiles

Unsurprisingly, the photofiles
– from Evart, Osceola Co., on
10 November 2010 – depict a
Pileated Woodpecker.

Ash-throated Flycatcher
(*Myiarchus cinerascens*)

vote: 1-6

two descriptions

One was described in Waterloo
Twp., Jackson Co., on 12 May
2011.

**Clark's Nutcracker (*Nucifraga*
columbiana)**

vote: 0-7

one description

One was reported in Harrisville
State Park, Alcona Co., on 10
October 2011.

Fish Crow (*Corvus ossifragus*)

vote: 4-3 in the second round

16 descriptions

two photofiles

23 audiofiles

In an initial review (Putnam 2011),
three Fish Crows were accepted
for Three Oaks Twp., Berrien
Co., from 16 May to 28 October
2009 – but during that review the
MBRC accidentally omitted one
observer's audio evidence. That
observer claimed a minimum of five
Fish Crows – two more than had
previously been accepted.

So as to rectify its earlier omission,
the committee reconsidered
the 2009 Fish Crow record to
determine if the additional audio
evidence would support the
presence of one or two additional
individuals. One of these two was
accepted but the other was not; see
the first Fish Crow account under
“Records Accepted.”

Fish Crow (*Corvus ossifragus*)

vote: 0-7

four descriptions

three photofiles

Up to two Fish Crows were
reported from Three Oaks Twp.,
Berrien Co., from 8 April to 27
November 2010. Of these one
was accepted – see the second
Fish Crow entry under “Records
Accepted” – and one was not.
Regarding the latter, two observers
documented a second Fish Crow,
but in both cases the documentation
was less than compelling. One
mentioned two Fish Crows calling,
but did not describe how either
sounded. The other did describe
the vocalizations, but was unclear
as to whether both birds were
heard repeatedly or whether one
bird was heard multiple times
and the second bird was heard
just once. Commenting on this
ambiguity, one committee member
wrote, “This is a matter of some
significance to me, as I’m reluctant
to heavily weight a call that a
single observer heard once. In

such situations I don't trust myself – always want to hear the bird again to make sure that my initial impression was correct – and if, under such circumstances, I don't trust myself then I'm unlikely to trust other observers, either.”

Fish Crow (*Corvus ossifragus*)

vote: 1-6

one description

One was claimed in Harrisville, Alcona Co., on 8 October 2010.

Fish Crow (*Corvus ossifragus*)

vote: 3-4

two descriptions

Up to two Fish Crows were reported from Three Oaks Twp., Berrien Co., from 9 April 2011 through at least 6 July 2012. One of these was accepted (see the third Fish Crow account under “Records Accepted”), whereas the other was not.

The second bird was documented by one observer in late May; however, in that observer's report, the two birds were identified because “They were calling with the single syllable ‘cah’ call,” and that description of the vocalizations does not eliminate some American Crow sounds. For example, Kilham (1989) noted that female American Crows can give a one-syllable ‘caa’ prior to egg-laying and during the incubation period, and that they can be away from the nest when they give it.

Cave Swallow (*Petrochelidon fulva*)

vote: 0-7 for all three individuals
one description

Three flew past St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 27 October 2010; however, for those birds the only plumage features described were “ochre throats that blended into the breast” and pale rumps, and those two characteristics can be observed in not only Cave Swallows but also juvenile Cliff Swallows.

Cave Swallow (*Petrochelidon fulva*)

vote: 1-6 in the second round

one description

six photofiles

Two were reported at St. Joseph, Berrien Co., on 27 October 2010.

They appeared about an hour after the three individuals mentioned in the preceding Cave Swallow account.

Of the two later birds, one was accepted – see the first Cave Swallow entry under “Records Accepted” – but the other was not. Regarding the latter, the description noted “red foreheads, ochre throats bleeding into the breast, and pale rumps,” but that combination of features does not eliminate a juvenile Cliff Swallow – in which, according to Brown and Brown (1995), the forehead can be rusty and the throat can be buff-colored. As for the photofiles, those that show two birds are too blurry to allow confident identification – a testimony to the challenges of photographing fly-by swallows.



Cave Swallow (*Petrochelidon fulva*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was reported at Sterling State Park, Monroe Co., on 6 November 2010, and the report described a throat that looked “a bit buffy,” “no headlamp as it first flew toward me,” and a “rump patch;” however, as is indicated above, the combination of dark forehead, buff throat, and pale rump can match a young Cliff Swallow.

Mountain Bluebird (*Sialia curruoides*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was claimed in Park Twp., Ottawa Co., on 5 to 7 July 2011.

Swainson’s Thrush (*Catharus ustulatus*)

vote: 1-6

one description

One was described in Sylvan Twp., Washtenaw Co., on 18 December 2010.

“Yellow” Palm Warbler (*Setophaga palmarum hypochrysea*)

vote: 1-6

one description

One was identified in Fenton Township, Genesee County, on 19 December 1981.

“Yellow” Palm Warbler (*Setophaga palmarum hypochrysea*)

vote: 1-6

one description

one photofile

One was reported from Dearborn, Wayne Co., on 9 October 2010.

“Yellow” Palm Warbler (*Setophaga palmarum hypochrysea*)

vote: 1-6

one description

One was described in Hope Twp., Barry Co., on 9 May 2011.

“Audubon’s” Yellow-rumped Warbler (*Setophaga coronata auduboni*)

vote: 2-5

one description

23 photofiles

One was reported in Lowell, Kent Co., from late autumn 2007 to 2 March 2008.

Black-throated Gray Warbler (*Setophaga nigrescens*)

vote: 1-6

one description

One was claimed in Amber Twp., Mason Co., on 24 April 2011.

Townsend’s Warbler (*Setophaga townsendi*)

vote: 1-6 in the second round

one description

One male was described from Dearborn, Wayne Co., on 1 May 1988.

This record was originally accepted in 1988 (Chu 1991), but was reviewed again in 2011; as is mentioned above (see the single Townsend's Warbler entry under "Records Accepted"), the record was reviewed a second time because the original review had failed to account for hybridization between Townsend's and Hermit Warblers – a problem addressed in detail by Rohwer and Wood (1998).

Rohwer and Wood evaluated spring and summer male warblers – Townsend's Warblers, Hermit Warblers, and their intergrades – and they did so with seven characteristics: crown color; back color; bib corner (a character using the position of the bib corner to indicate bib size); extent of yellow on the underbody; intensity of yellow on the underbody; mid-flank streaking; and lower-flank streaking.

With regard to these seven characters, the Dearborn bird was unclear for two: bib corner and back color.

(1) According to the observer, the bib "was fairly extensive" and "expanded down and outward to the upper chest (similar to the bib in a Black-capped Chickadee)." However, most committee members were concerned that these clauses did not describe the extent to which the black of the bib met the dark of the back; Rohwer and

Wood (1998:287) described the Townsend's extreme as showing a "broad black union" between bib and back (whereas the Hermit extreme shows a "gap between bib and back").

(2) The observer described the back simply as "dark," and that descriptor does not address color, which should be greenish in a Townsend's (versus gray in a Hermit).

Given the lack of clarity with respect to bib corner and back color, the committee was concerned that a Townsend's/Hermit intergrade could not be confidently excluded.

Townsend's Warbler (*Setophaga townsendi*)

vote: 1-6 in the second round
one description

One male was reported from Whitefish Point, Chippewa Co., on 13 May 1996.

This record, originally reviewed in 1996 (Reinoehl 1997), was re-reviewed in 2011 – and, like the record immediately above, it was not accepted because the documentation did not clearly eliminate a Townsend's/Hermit intergrade.

Specifically, with respect to the seven characters that Rohwer and Wood (1998) used to evaluate Townsend's Warblers, Hermit Warblers, and their intergrades (see above), the description of



the Whitefish Point bird was problematic for five. First, there was no description of the bib corner, with the observer mentioning only a black throat. Second and third, the description noted that the “upper breast was yellow,” and as such it did not address the intensity of the yellow; moreover, if the yellow was truly restricted to the upper breast then its extent was more limited than is typical for a “pure” male Townsend’s. And fourth and fifth, the bird was said only to have “black streaks down the flanks,” so that there was no indication of how heavy the streaking was on either the middle flanks or the lower flanks. Regarding these last four, one committee member wrote, “The details could be consistent with a hybrid Townsend’s x Hermit Warbler, for example, if the streaks down the flanks were not heavy, the yellow was restricted to only the uppermost portion of the breast, and the yellow on the breast was quite a bit duller than the yellow on the face.”

Spotted Towhee (*Pipilo maculatus*)

vote: 4-3 in the second round
 one description
 two photofiles

One male was reported in Lake Twp., Benzie Co., from 11 to 16 November 2010, and photos showed it to have the white wingbars and boldly white-

streaked saddle of a Spotted Towhee; however, the bird also had a narrow rim of white at the primary bases, peeking out from beneath the greater upper primary coverts. The MBRC was divided about the significance of this white rim: some were concerned that it suggested the presence of Eastern Towhee alleles, whereas others were not.

Spotted Towhee (*Pipilo maculatus*)

vote: 0-7
 one description
 eight photofiles
 One – claimed in Irving Twp., Barry Co., on 27 April 2011 – was shown by the observer’s photos to be a male Eastern Towhee.

Canyon Towhee (*Melospiza fusca*)

vote: 0-7
 one description
 One was reported in Harrisville State Park, Alcona Co., on 2 May 2011.

Lark Sparrow (*Chondestes grammacus*)

vote: 1-6 in the second round
 one description
 One was described from Peninsula Point, Delta Co., on 1 May 2010.

Lark Bunting (*Calamospiza melanocorys*)

vote: 3-4 for both birds (first review); 3-4 for both birds (second review)
 one description

Two, neither of them males wearing alternate plumage, were described from Marquette in Marquette Co. on 22 September 2010.

Initially the documentation for this record consisted of an e-mail from the observer, and on the basis of that e-mail the record was not accepted.

Shortly after this initial decision, a committee member asked the observer about providing a more formal account of his sighting, and in fact the observer had already prepared one, so he immediately submitted it. This submission provided some additional information, so the MBRC decided to review the record again; however, despite the added information, the second review yielded the same negative result as the first.

For both reviews, the committee was divided between those who asserted that the description matched only a Lark Bunting and those who argued that the description was atypical for a Lark Bunting in several respects. The former pointed to size (larger than a nearby White-crowned Sparrow, “mostly because they were chunkier”), the large bill (the observer’s first thought was, “strange place for a grosbeak”), and the presence of a “prominent white crescent-shaped panel/ edging on the wings.” Conversely, voters with a contrary view

claimed that the birds’ face was described incorrectly for a Lark Bunting, with too much emphasis on a pale supercilium and lores and no mention of a white malar stripe, and that the white panel/ edging on the wings was not prominent enough (the observer wrote that the “white edging was not as prominent as is the white wing patch on most field guide renderings of Lark Bunting.”)

Baird's Sparrow (*Ammodramus bairdii*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was claimed in Harrisville State Park, Alcona Co., on 11 and 12 April 2011.

Nelson's Sparrow (*Ammodramus nelsoni*)

vote: 3-4

four descriptions

17 photofiles

Of four Nelson’s Sparrows reported from Royalton Twp. in Berrien Co. on 9 October 2010, one was not accepted. The bird in question – documented only by photofile – was partially hidden by vegetation, such that its chest could not be seen, and because its chest was hidden, a majority of committee members were concerned that a Saltmarsh Sparrow could not be eliminated from consideration.



This individual was subsequently reviewed as a Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow, and under that less specific designation it was accepted. See the Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow account under "Records Accepted" above.

Nelson's Sparrow (*Ammodramus nelsoni*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was described from Harrisville State Park in Alcona Co. on 4 October 2011.

Saltmarsh Sparrow (*Ammodramus caudacutus*)

vote: 2-5

one specimen

While studying the identification of sharp-tailed sparrows, Sibley (2005) found a Saltmarsh Sparrow specimen (MCZ 192931) whose label gives the collecting locality as "Michigan (Detroit)" and the date of collection as "June 1, 1886." However, the label also has the preprinted words "Collection of C. F. Batchelder," and those words inspired uncertainty (Sibley 2005:525).

No other Batchelder specimens from Detroit, Michigan are in the MCZ, and in fact Batchelder himself was in Europe from April 1886 until October 1887 and made no known trips to the Great Lakes (Taber 1958). So Batchelder most likely acquired this specimen

from another collector, and with the available information it is impossible to verify the data on the label.

In response to this information, the committee was divided. The majority opinion was summarized by the committee member who wrote, "The only reasonable conclusion is that the label is of unreliable authenticity, and thus the specimen is unacceptable." Conversely, in the minority view, to reject a specimen because its label information cannot be authenticated – not because it is demonstrably suspect, but simply because it cannot be cross-checked – is to apply a standard that the MBRC has never applied before, and that many specimens could not meet.

Saltmarsh Sparrow (*Ammodramus caudacutus*)

vote: 0-7

one description

One was reported from Bingham and Verona townships in Huron Co. on 27 September 2011; not accepted as a Saltmarsh Sparrow, it was reconsidered as a Nelson's/Saltmarsh, but was not accepted again. See the Nelson's/Saltmarsh Sparrow account immediately below.

In choosing not to accept the bird as either a Saltmarsh or a Nelson's/Saltmarsh, MBRC members gave three reasons.

First, the observer described a “Darkish gray” crown and said that “A median crown stripe was looked for and not seen” – but any sharp-tailed sparrow should have at least a narrow gray median crown stripe. Second, the chest was described as having “Clear dark striping with a tiny ‘congregation’ or little swirl at center,” but neither sharp-tailed sparrow shows an aggregation of streaks at the center of the chest. And third, the under tail coverts were said to be “Whitish,” similar or identical to the “white belly area,” but in many (or perhaps all) sharp-tailed sparrows the crissum is buffier than the belly.

Nelson’s/Saltmarsh Sparrow
(*Ammodramus nelsoni/caudacutus*)

vote: 3-4

one description

One was reported from Bingham and Verona townships in Huron Co. on 27 September 2011; not accepted as a Saltmarsh Sparrow, it was reconsidered as a Nelson’s/Saltmarsh, but was not accepted again. For an explanation of these decisions, see the Saltmarsh Sparrow account immediately above.

Western Tanager (*Piranga ludoviciana*)

vote: 3-4

one description

One was described from Warren Dunes State Park, Berrien Co., on 18 and 19 August 2011.

Western Tanager (*Piranga ludoviciana*)

vote: 2-5

one description

three photofiles

One was identified at Lake Erie Metropark, Wayne Co., on 2 October 2011.

Blue Grosbeak (*Passerina caerulea*)

vote: 1-6 in the second round

one description

One was reported at Brockway Mountain, Keweenaw Co., on 12 June 2010.

“Purple” Common Grackle
(*Quiscalus quiscula stonei*)

vote: 0-7

three photofiles

One was claimed near Boyne City, Charlevoix Co., from 1 to 21 April 2010.

Corrigenda

Several items in Putnam (2011) require correction. For the Ross's Goose in Berrien Springs, Berrien Co., a date range of 16 December 2009 to 4 January 2010 is given; the correct date range is 16 December 2009 to 20 January 2010. Also, for the Cinnamon Teal at the Pte. Mouillee State Game Area in Monroe Co., a date range of 22-27 May 2010 is given; the correct date range is 22-28 May 2010. And finally, for the Scissor-tailed Flycatcher in Union, Cass Co., the documentation is not limited to photographs from John Cassady; Cassady also provided a description, and photos were submitted by both Cassady and Adam Byrne.

Acknowledgments

Tim Baerwald, Adam Byrne, Dan Duso, Don Henise, Dale Leitzke, Kip Miller, Richard Pedler, Chris and Robin Saunders, Melinda Stamp, Phil Vreeman, Carolyn Weng, Jonathan Wuepper, and Joseph Youngman answered questions about specific records; Byrne pointed out all of the corrections in the Corrigenda; and Sylke Frahnert (Abteilung Aves, Museum für Naturkunde, Berlin) and Jeremiah Trimble (Ornithology Department, Museum of Comparative Zoology, Harvard University, Cambridge) kindly provided photofiles of ZMB 12406 and MCZ 192931, respectively.

Literature Cited

- Alström, P., and K. Mild. 2003. Pipits and wagtails. Princeton University Press, Princeton.
- Arterburn, J. W., and J. A. Grzybowski. 2003. Hybridization between Glossy and White-faced Ibises. *North American Birds* 57:136-139.
- Brown, C. R., and M. B. Brown. 1995. Cliff Swallow (*Petrochelidon pyrrhonota*). In Poole, A., ed. *The Birds of North America Online*. Cornell Laboratory of Ornithology, Ithaca. Retrieved on 30 January 2011 from <<http://bna.birds.cornell.edu/bnaproxy.bird.cornell.edu/bna/species/149>>.
- Byrne, A. M. 2006. Michigan bird survey: summer 2005 (June-July). *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 13:27-51.
- Byrne, A. M. 2012. Birding journal: Lucy's Warbler in Michigan. *North American Birds* 66:12-13.

- Chu, P. C. 1991. Actions of the MBRC for 1988 and 1989. *Jack-Pine Warbler* 68(5):19-24.
- Chu, P. C. 1992. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 1990 and 1991. *Jack-Pine Warbler* 69(5):17-23.
- Chu, P. C. 1996. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 1994. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 3:43-60.
- Dombrowski, L. J. 2011. Michigan bird survey: summer 2010 (June - July). *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 18:22-51.
- Gochfeld, M., and G. Tudor. 1976. An apparent hybrid goldeneye from Maine. *Wilson Bulletin* 88:348-349.
- Heil, R. S. 1981. An avian fallout and the first Massachusetts records for Black-chinned Hummingbird and Lucy's Warbler. *American Birds* 35:139-141.
- Howell, S. N. G. 1994. Magnificent and Great Frigatebirds in the eastern Pacific: a new look at an old problem. *Birding* 26:400-415.
- Kilham, L. 1989. *The American Crow and the Common Raven*. Texas A & M University Press, College Station.
- Martin, P. R., and B. M. DiLabio. 1994. Identification of Common x Barrow's Goldeneye hybrids in the field. *Birding* 26:104-105.
- Neumann, J., and G. Mauersberger. 1990. Albert und Louis Koch und ihre nordamerikanischem Sammlungen. *Mitteilungen aus dem Zoologischen Museum in Berlin* 66, *Annalen für Ornithologie Supplementheft* 14:95-111.
- Putnam, C. G. 2011. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 2010. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 18:289-331.
- Pyle, P. 1997. Identification guide to North American birds, part I. Columbidae to Ploceidae. Slate Creek Press, Bolinas.
- Reinoehl, J. 1997. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 1996. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 4:229-243.
- Reinoehl, J. 1998. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 1997. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 5:209-225.
- Reinoehl, J. 1999. Actions of the Michigan Bird Records Committee for 1998. *Michigan Birds and Natural History* 6:225-241.
- Rohwer, S., and C. Wood. 1998. Three hybrid zones between Hermit and Townsend's Warblers in Washington and Oregon. *Auk* 115:284-310.

- Sibley, D. A. 2005. A possible specimen record of Saltmarsh Sharp-tailed Sparrow (*Ammodramus caudacutus*) from Michigan, with comments on the reliability of specimen data. *North American Birds* 59:524-525.
- Taber, W. 1958. In memoriam: Charles Foster Batchelder. *Auk* 75:15-25.
- Taverner, P. A. 1936. Taxonomic comments on Red-tailed Hawks. *Condor* 38:66-71.